# CONCORDIA THEOLOGICAL MONTHLY

The Scope of the Redemptive Task MARTIN H. SCHARLEMANN

The Creation Account of Genesis WALTER R. ROEHRS

Homiletics

Theological Observer

Book Review

Vol. XXXVI

May 1965

No. 5

# BOOK REVIEW

All books reviewed in this periodical may be procured from or through Concordia Publishing House, 3558 South Jefferson Avenue, St. Louis, Missouri 63118.

BULLETIN OF THE AMERICAN SCHOOLS OF ORIENTAL RESEARCH. Number 173 (February 1964). Edited by William Foxwell Albright and Ray L. Cleveland. Baltimore: American Schools of Oriental Research, 1964. 68 pages. Paper. Copies of this issue may be purchased at \$1.00 from Alfred von Rohr Sauer, Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, Mo. 63105, or Albert Glock, Concordia Teachers College, River Forest, Ill. 60305

This issue of the ASOR Bulletin is of interest to members of The Lutheran Church - Missouri Synod primarily because of Paul W. Lapp's 41-page report "The 1963 Excavation at Ta 'annek" and Delbert R. Hillers' 6-page article "An Alphabetic Cuneiform Tablet from Taanach (TT 433)." The "1963 Excavation at Ta 'annek" is of course the first full-dress joint archaeological expedition of Concordia Seminary and the American School of Oriental Research at Jerusalem to the site of the Biblical Taanach (Joshua 12:21; 17:11; 21:25; Judg. 1:27; 5:19; 1 Kings 4:12; 1 Chron. 7:29), directed by Lapp and Sauer. "TT 437" is the exciting Canaanite cuneiform tablet from the 12th century before Christ that the expedition so unexpectedly turned up on the very last day of digging. Lapp's scholarly "preliminary report," liberally illustrated with sketches and photographs, describes the history of Ta 'annek as a spasmodically occupied site from the 27th/26th century before Christ to the 10th century of our era. He introduces the reader to the Bronze Age buildings that the expedition unearthed, with their drains, their ovens, their hearths, and their implements. He gives a detailed picture of the "cultic

structure" or temple and its fascinating contents - including pig astragali, stelae, and a terra-cotta figurine mold. Hillers' thorough discussion of the cuneiform tablet indicates that it was probably a business document in a variant near-Hebrew Ugaritic alphabet relating to a shipment of grain or flour into the city; it establishes the fact that as late as the 12th century a variety of alphabetic cuneiform script was used for business purposes at Taanach. All this makes for high hopes for the 1965 digging season! In the meantime the proprietary interest that Lutherans have in this expedition should encourage many of them to order a copy of this important number of the ASOR Bulletin.

#### ARTHUR CARL PIEPKORN

HONEST TO GOD. By John A. T. Robinson. (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1963). 143 pages. Paper. \$1.65.

This little volume, described by one campus pastor as the book most hotly discussed in recent months "from Helsinki to Tokyo," deserves every church leader's careful attention.

There are those who say the extension of Robinson's argument can only lead down the road to pantheism, universalism, moral relativism, or "a world religion of eclecticism." Other critics add that he has erred so repeatedly that it is only a question as to *where* to attack him.

The Anglican Bishop of Woolwich begins his study with a reference to the "growing gulf between the traditional orthodox supernaturalism in which our Faith has been framed and the categories which the 'lay' world . . . finds meaningful today" (p.8). It is this gulf which he is trying to bridge by being "honest" to God, by scoring the view of a God "out there" in favor of His immanence, and by a use of overall language and imagery which will make the Christian faith relevant to a paganized society.

Robinson says he has "never really doubted the fundamental truth of the Christian faith — though I have constantly found myself questioning its expression" (p. 27). He sees the debate as "how far Christianity is committed to a mythological, or supranaturalist, picture of the universe." (P. 33)

Quoting Tillich, he seems to favor the possible elimination of even the word "God" itself, so conditioned it is with *a* Being "out there" (p. 47). Tillich's greatest contribution to theology he sees as "the reinterpretation of transcendence in a way which preserves its reality while detaching it from the projection of supranaturalism . . ." (P. 56)

An example of this approach is seen in his discussion of the terms "Christ" and "God" (pp. 70, 73). Robinson holds that these two terms are not interchangeable in the New Testament (though they are from the supranaturalistic view), that the Bible "does not say that Jesus was God, simply like that" (p. 70), that it is an open question "whether Jesus ever claimed to be the Son of God, let alone God" (p. 72), that "Jesus never claims to be God, personally: yet he always claims to bring God, completely" (p. 73). Still he holds that Jesus "is perfect man and perfect God - not as a mixture of oil and water, of natural and supernaturalbut as the embodiment through obedience of 'the beyond in our midst,' of the transcendence of love." (P. 77)

It is around such *sic et non* statements throughout the volume that the "Honest to God debate" rages. For instance, what does Robinson mean by "the symbol" of the Virgin Birth (p. 77)? Or by the statement: "This mythological drama — such as the ransom paid to the Devil or the notion that the

Father punishes the Son in our place — is in any case a perversion of what the New Testament says" (p. 78)? Or his expressed desire to avoid the "morass of relativism and subjectivism" (p. 113) when the statement that precedes the discussion of "sex relations before marriage" and "divorce" reads: "Nothing can of itself always be labelled as 'wrong'" (p.118). In sum his call is not "a reassertion of the sanctions of the supranatural" (p. 121), but, as in the case of these latter problems, the conviction that "love's casuistry must cut deeper and must be more searching, more demanding, than anything required by the law" (p. 119). A parallel assertion runs: "Chastity is the expression of charity-of caring, enough. And this is the criterion for every form of behavior, inside marriage or out of it, in sexual ethics or in any other field. For nothing else makes a thing right or wrong." (P. 119)

Is this neoantinomian and relativistic? Robinson's own answer (in this book and subsequently) is no. Although he is admittedly against "'orthodox' supranaturalism," he also insists he wants to guard his flank against "non-Christian naturalism," and avers that he affirms Rom. 8:38 "with all his being" (p. 127). And yet, although Robinson grants he has "not attempted here to traverse the full range of Christian doctrine" (page 133), one wonders where the forgiveness of sins is in his whole discussion.

For some, the insistent question "What did he *mean?*" may be answered by Robinson's words in a recent newspaper article: "What I want to do is not to deny God in any sense, but to put him back into the middle of life — where Jesus showed us he belongs. For the Christian God is not remote. He is involved; he is implicated. If Jesus Christ means anything, he means that God belongs to this world... I want God to be as real for our modern, secular scientific world as He ever was for the 'ages of faith.'" (Quoted, on p. 279, in David L. Edwards [ed.], The Honest to God Debate: Some Reactions to the Book Honest to God [Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1963]).\*

For the mature thinker, this book can be a help to crystallize many of the issues in the theological dialogs of our day. But the persistent question which must be asked of its pages is: Where is the *skandalon?* Where is the treatment of the rock of unbelief in man's heart to the "offense of the cross" (Gal. 5:11)? Where is there room for *Pater*, *peccavi* and "against Thee, Thee only, have I sinned" (Ps. 51:4)? When these are missing, whatever the semantic intention of a book, the author has not been fully "honest to God." DONALD L. DEFFNER

- TEXTE DER KIRCHENVÄTER: EINE AUSWAHL NACH THEMEN GEORD-NET. Edited by Alfons Heilmann and Heinrich Kraft. Munich: Kösel-Verlag, 1963-64. 664, 592, 731, 637 pages; 4 volumcs. Cloth. DM 29.50 each volume.
- GEBETE UND BETRACHTUNGEN DER KIRCHENVÄTER. Edited by Birgit Weiss and Stephan Otto. Munich: Kösel-Verlag, 1963. 346 pages. Cloth, DM 10.80; paper, DM 8.50.

Between 1911 and 1938 the Kösel-Verlag put out two highly respected series of patristic translations into German — 83 volumes in all — entitled *Bibliothek der Kirchenväter*. From these, supplemented with translations from other sources, the editors have assembled this admirable broad-scale anthology of readings from the works of the fathers of

the first seven centuries of the church. As beneficiaries of their labors the editors had in mind primarily clergymen --- both parish priests and teachers - with patristic interests, although historians and philosophers working in the area of the ancient church will find this collection hardly less useful. Some 70 ancient authors are drawn on, from St. Ambrose to St. Zeno of Verona. The great luminaries are not the only ones included; there are texts from lesser lights like SS. Firmilian of Caesarea, Fulgentius of Ruspe, Isidore of Pelusium, Methodius of Olympus, Mesrob, Maximus of Turin, and Nilus of Ancyra, and even from such unorthodox authors as Isaac of Nineveh and Tatian.

Volume I covers the knowledge of God, language about God, God's attributes, the Holy Trinity; the Creator, creation, the defense of creation, the beauty of nature, divine providence; the creation of man, Paradise and the primal sin, the divine image and the composition of man, the value of the soul, soul and body, the members and competences of the body, the care of body and soul; temptations and desires, the cardinal sins, the cause and purpose of evil, the knowledge and condemnation of sin, and sin's consequences. Volume II takes up God's will, His ownership of everything, His grace; Christ's love, His Person, His work, His life on earth, the cross as symbol and reality, the Virgin Mary; faith, conversion and forgiveness, the ascent of the soul, righteousness, the commandments of God, the love of God, the activity of the Holy Spirit, the adoption of sons, the striving for perfection and the gift of perseverance, and the saints. Volume III discusses Christian behavior, the fruits of the Spirit, spiritual growth, the two ways and the two kingdoms, the love of the world and how to overcome it, suffering and conflict, patience and confidence, fate, prayer, labor, leisure, withdrawal, speech and silence, fasting, joy; the individual and society, harmony and

340

<sup>\*</sup> Other works that have come out in this connection include: John A. T. Robinson, *Christian Morals Today*, (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1964); Oliver Fielding Clarke, For Christ's Sake: A Reply to the Bishop of Woolwich's Book Honest to God and a Positive Continuation of the Discussion, 3d ed. (New York: Morehouse-Barlow Co., 1964); D. M. Mackinnon, H. A. Williams, A. R. Vidler, and J. S. Bezzant, Objections to Christian Belief (New York: J. B. Lippincott Company, 1964).

peace, judging others, poverty and riches, love of the neighbor, the works of mercy; vocation, the state and the government, sex and marriage, the Christian family, and celibacy. The subjects in Volume IV are the church, persecution and martyrdom, Rome and the papacy, the episcopal office, the priesthood, preaching and the cure of souls; Baptism, the Holy Eucharist; the Sacred Scriptures, the Old Testament and its fulfillment, Christ's teaching; the transitoriness of earthly things, death and reflection on death, the resurrection of the dead, the Last Judgment, eternal condemnation, and eternal bliss. With nearly 1,500 separate entries each text averages around 550 words.

For the reader who can handle the lucid German in which the translations are couched this is a most rewarding and valuable tool, bound to be in extensive use for information, for instruction, and for spiritual reading. A fifth volume, still to be published, promises greatly to enhance the value of the set through its index of Biblical passages, its detailed index of subjects, and its patristic lexicon.

The second title is a kind of by-product of the larger work. It is a charming breviary of prayers and meditations from the fathers and the liturgies of the ancient church, designed to serve as a springboard for the user's own mental prayer. The selections are short — rarely more than a hundred words or so — and are distributed over four headings: The person who prays, the God whom he addresses, the gifts of grace, everyday prayer. Otto's postscript essay is a perceptive discussion of the relation between our praying and our knowledge of God.

# ARTHUR CARL PIEPKORN

MEMOIRS OF THE CATHOLIC UNIVER-SITY OF AMERICA, 1918-1960. By Roy J. Deferrari. Boston: Daughters of St. Paul, 1962. 458 pages. Cloth. \$5.00. Holder of an earned doctorate from Princeton University and no less than 13 honorary ones, Deferrari is widely known as the editor of the series *Fathers of the Church* and of *A Lexicon Based on the Summa Theologica* of St. Thomas Aquinas, a scholar and an administrator. His volume should have had the title "Memoirs of a Dean of the Catholic University of America." Candid and forthright, he deals with a multitude of problems associated with higher education, especially graduate education. For those so situated the work will prove enjoyable, practical, and profitable. CARL S. MEYER

MINISTERS OF CHRIST: A COMMEN-TARY ON THE SECOND EPISTLE OF PAUL TO THE CORINTHIANS. By John P. Meyer. Milwaukee: Northwestern Publishing House, 1963. xiv and 326 pages. Cloth. \$5.00.

I never did feel like writing a critical review of this volume, for John P. Meyer was my instructor in systematic theology at the Evangelical Lutheran Theological Seminary in Thiensville, Wis., back in the 1930s. And since his death at the age of 91 on Nov. 10, 1964, the idea of writing a critical review of his work has become repugnant. John P. Meyer was a remarkable teacher. He had none of the dramatic flair of his brilliant colleague, August Pieper. His charisma was of another order. I recall vividly the opening day of the school year 1935-36. Professor Pieper broke, rather than walked, through the door, looking like one of the Old Testament prophets that he interpreted with his peculiar blend of scholarly penetration and intuitive congeniality, and declared: "Heute keine Arbeit! Erst Stimmung machen!" And he proceeded to make Stimmung in a way that left the class hushed and breathless. Professor Meyer came in with a sheaf of mimeographed papers in his hand, bade us good morning, and made his only preliminary remark, viz., "Will someone please distribute the outlines." We proceeded to work, quietly

and methodically, on the prolegomena, the theme being that all theology and theologizing has as its goal the greater glory of God. And somehow, before the hour was over, John P. Meyer had in his own quiet way created as much *Stimmung* as August Pieper in his.

It is the calm and resonant voice of this consecrated man that I hear as I read this exposition of the Second Epistle of Paul to the Corinthians. I sense again the childlike reverence for the Word, the singlehearted devotion to the inspired text, the total submission to the Lord Jesus Christ there revealed, that made so many of his hours memorable hours. The memorableness was not so much sensed at the time as brought home to you in retrospect; when all was done, you knew that something massive and determinative had happened to you, that you would never again be the man that you were before God spoke to you in the words of this quiet, often ailing man. If others hear in this careful and reverent exposition of Second Corinthians that same voice, their lives will be enriched, as mine was, by one whom I remember and mourn as a father in Christ.

# Martin H. Franzmann

EVANGELISCHE ETHIK. By Hans-Georg Fritzsche. 2d edition. Berlin: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 1963. 312 pages. Cloth. DM 13.50.

While every Christian is free to speak of the Christian life in whatever way it is given him to speak, it is nonetheless necessary that every Christian discourse on this subject be anchored to the primal Christian confession. Coherence is lost when ethical discourse is limited to a discussion of the will of God for man in his activities. This procedure has an undeniable pedagogical advantage. After all, the Christian does need very much to understand his situation before ethical insights become possible. That is also the strength of this book, written from the perspective of the German context. However, it is a contextual ethical discourse which is not consistently structured upon Law *and* Gospel.

The author offers telling and sharply enlightening insights of the function of sin, and there can be no dispute that modern man needs this as well as firm guidance in the paths of rectitude. The resultant ethical discipline may be both remarkable and attractive, and it may also promote a healthy social life.

But Christian ethics requires a constant and direct orientation upon the Gospel, which alone gives new life to the old man. Christian ethics becomes moral philosophy when it is taught in disassociation from repentance, that is, contrition and faith.

Nonetheless the author deserves our acknowledgement for his attempt to simplify the categories of ethical discourse. This has a considerable practical advantage. He treats each of the Ten Commandments according to four basic questions: (1) Offense and fulfillment; (2) philosophical and ideological assertions which are contrary to a particular commandment; (3) views which absolutize a commandment, so that only a particular injunction or prohibition is seen as most important for the Christian life; and (4) the dogmatic background for each commandment. But if the author is concerned to see the issues thetically and antithetically, it would have been better to ask for the meaning of the commandment and immediately relate it to its dogmatic context and then to proceed with the negative or antithetical discussion.

To see ethics as *Bildungsprozess* in the sense of Trillhaas, that is, as a process whereby the person is ethically shaped through appropriate instruction, is by no means "non-Biblical," as some American ethicists have argued. After all, it is written: "All Scripture is inspired by God and profitable for teaching, for reproof, for correction, and for training in righteousness, that the man of God may be complete, equipped for every good work." Fritzsche does not offer us this kind of *Bildungsprozess* explicitly and directly. It is a discourse about ethical insights which is not closely and consistently associated with Christian motivations. It is not enough to know. The Christian also needs power to do.

# RICHARD KLANN

- LUTHER: EINFÜHRUNG IN SEIN DEN-KEN. By Gerhard Ebeling. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1964. 321 pages. Cloth. DM 14.00.
- FIDES, SPES UND CARITAS BEIM JUNGEN LUTHER UNTER BESON-DERER BERÜCKSICHTIGUNG DER MITTELALTERLICHEN TRADITION. By Reinhard Schwarz. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter & Co., 1962. 444 pages. Paper. DM 42.00.

Ebeling, well versed in Luther's writings, knows how to penetrate to the heart of the Reformer's thoughts. In this introduction to Luther's thinking he is not primarily concerned with the wide range of Luther's world of thought — a task left to Heinrich Bornkamm's excellent volume — but with the depth of Luther's theology. Though Ebeling encourages the general reader with the promise that his book does not require any special knowledge, a considerable acquaintance with philosophy and theology will help him to think along with the author as this Luther scholar would have him do.

Ebeling's book reproduces a series of lectures which he delivered at the University of Zurich and, in part, at Drew University in Madison, N. J. To these he added a lecture delivered at Wiesbaden on "Der Gottesgedanke im Abendland." Anyone who has read and appreciated *Die Theologie Martin Lathers* by Paul Althaus will also appreciate Ebeling's analysis.

Schwarz, who assisted Hanns Rückert and Ebeling with the republication of Luther's

first lectures on the Psalms, takes the reader into Luther's lecture room at various times during his theological development. The fact that his dissertation on faith, hope, and charity was included in the series Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte, founded by Karl Holl and Hans Lietzmann and now edited by Kurt Aland, Walther Eltester, and Rückert, emphasizes its value for students of Luther's theology. Schwarz traces Luther's mounting antipathy to Occamism and Scotism through three periods of the Reformer's early Biblical lectures, on Peter Lombard's Sentences (1509 to 1510), on the Psalms (1513-15), and on St. Paul (1515-18). His conclusions are adequately documented with references to Luther's writings and to those of the schoolmen with whom Luther was at odds. As in the case of Ebeling's book, so in that of Schwarz, a knowledge of Scholasticism and its Aristotelian heritage, as well as of Luther's Biblical orientation, will be of great value to the reader. This study, unlike Ebeling's lectures, is definitely intended for LEWIS W. SPITZ specialists.

THE MYSTERY OF THE TEMPLE, OR THE MANNER OF GOD'S PRESENCE TO HIS CREATURES FROM GENESIS TO THE APOCALYPSE. By Yves M.-J. Congar, translated from the French by Reginald F. Trevett. Westminster, Md.: The Newman Press, 1962. xiii and 248 pages, plus 3 appendices. Cloth. \$6.75.

This book represents the investigation and further development of "the idea that the essential point of God's plan and the place of the faithful within it could be well formulated in terms of a temple built of living stones" (p. ix). Successive stages in Biblical history are marked by an "increasing inwardness" of God's presence (p. xi) and a movement from *things*, such as the cloud, the tent of meeting, the ark and the temple, to a *people, persons*, and eventually one Divine Person, His Son. In turn His holy eschatological community, the new temple in which the divine Spirit resides, awaits the heavenly celebration when there will be no temple but God Himself and the Lamb.

Congar's precise and comprehensive manner of treatment makes this study a most welcome contribution to Biblical scholarship. With the abundant footnotes and their valuable bibliographical material, this is not only a book for the layman, for whom it was written, but also a reference work for the specialist.

Congar's accurate evaluation of the overemphasis on the opposition between priesthood and the prophetic office and his valuable observations concerning the meaning of the term "spiritual," that is, "of the Holy Spirit," in contradistinction to the metaphorical abstraction suggested by the term "spiritualization," deserve particular mention.

Not all scholars will agree with all conclusions reached. Exegetes in particular might rightly criticize the author's readiness to subsume individual texts too quickly under larger themes, failing thereby accurately to reflect the particularity of the particular context.

Appendices include a chronology, a discussion of the relation of the Virgin Mary to the temple, and a clarification of the difference between God's mode of presence in the Old and New Dispensations.

#### John H. Elliott

CALVIN: THE ORIGINS AND DEVELOP-MENT OF HIS RELIGIOUS THOUGHT. By François Wendel, translated from the French by Philip Mairet. New York: Harper & Row, 1963. 383 pages. Cloth. \$6.00.

Wendel published this study of Calvin in French in 1950. It ought to have been translated into English before this.

Part One is a "biographical outline." The 100-page summary is a model of a clear, authoritative, pertinent life history, factual and interpretative. Part Two is a 250-page treatment of Calvin's theological doctrine. Of outstanding worth is the first chapter of this section, on the editions, sources, and purpose of the *Institutes*. Luther, Augustine, Bucer, Roman Law, Erasmus, and Melanchthon all influenced Calvin. Wilhelm Pauck has emphasized Calvin's dependence on Bucer; Wendel finds it considerable, but also has much to say about Luther's influence on Calvin.

The remaining chapters of Wendel's work follow the Institutes in presenting Calvin's thought, but draw on Calvin's other writings, including his commentaries. This review cannot survey Wendel's total presentation, but a few points must be noted. Wendel recognizes the blame laid on Calvin for obscuring the distinction between Law and Gospel. Of Calvin's Christocentrism he says: "It cannot be said too often [that it] is as definite and as clearly expressed as Luther's." Calvin's insistence on the distinction between the two natures of Christ, which lead him to minimize the communication of attributes. makes for the extra calvinisticum. He includes redemption in predestination. He treats justification after he has dealt with sanctification, but he shows clearly the emptiness of works. Predestination, Wendel claims, cannot be made the central idea of Calvin's whole theology. Specifically in his doctrinal formulations concerning the Lord's Supper Calvin "set out to construct something new" (p. 329). Calvin differed with Luther regarding the ubiquity of Christ's humanity in the Incarnation. Sometimes Calvin is guilty of using defective terminology; sometimes he is ambiguous or even contradictory. He affirms, for example, that Christ's "own body in which He suffered and was resurrected" is present in the Sacrament (p. 340); again, he affirms that Christ's body is in heaven and cannot be present in several places at once at the Supper.

CARL S. MEYER

# HANDBUCHTHEOLOGISCHER GRUND-BEGRIFFE. Edited by Heinrich Fries. Vol. I: 880 pages; 1962. Vol. II: 966 pages; 1963. Munich: Kösel Verlag. Cloth. DM 55.00 the set.

Both Roman Catholic theologians and those of other denominations have often lamented that the newer Roman Catholic theology has not yet found expression in a full-fledged dogmatics. Until that time comes, the authoritative Handbuch theologischer Grundbegriffe, although alphabetically rather than systematically arranged, will serve as a superb substitute. The 101 contributors include some of the most prestigious names in European Roman Catholicism - Alfons and Johann Auer, Chenu, Congar, Fries, Füglister, Geiselmann, Gnilka, Jedin, Karrer, Küng, Pieper, Karl Rahner, Schelkle, Schlier, Schmaus, Semmelroth, Söhngen, Tresmontant, Vorgrimler, and Winklhofer, to name only some — as well as those of distinguished Lutheran scholars like Ernst Kinder (coauthor of the article "Reformation") and Wilhelm Maurer (author of the article "Protestantismus"). Each of the 154 articles is a major essay; the average length is around 6,250 words. The scholarship is thoroughly modern, the documentation unimpeachable. The general pattern of the major theological discussions is a Biblical section, a historical section, and a systematic section. The bibliographies are up to date, adequate in scope, and draw on non-Roman Catholic and non-German sources with refreshing frequency. A 30-page Sachregister enables the user to uncover materials on almost any subject of theological interest. For up-to-date information about European - especially German -Roman Catholic theology this reviewer knows no better book; even the Lutheran pastor or theologian whose interest is not primarily in Roman Catholic theology could profitably study this work as a stimulus and as a challenge to his own theological thinking. Some American Roman Catholic publisher should

put his own denomination (and the rest of the church as well) into his debt by putting out an English translation.

#### ARTHUR CARL PIEPKORN

RUF AN ALLE: GEORGE WHITEFIELD, BAHNBRECHER DER MODERNEN EVANGELISATION UND ERWEK-KUNGSTRÄGER IN ZWEI KON-TINENTEN. By Otto Riecker. Wuppertal: R. Brockhaus Verlag, 1962. 220 pages. Cloth. DM 13.80.

Riecker has written the first volume of the series called Aus der Welt der Erweckung edited by Erich Beyreuther. George Whitefield (1714—70) is an apt figure with which to begin this series. Among the revivalists he was one of the first and one of the greatest. He commanded the rapt attention of audiences on two continents often numbering more than 10,000. He moved not an inconsiderable number by the power of his preaching. He emphasized the sinfulness of man, the righteousness of Christ, rebirth through the Spirit of God, and love toward one's neighbor. He was a Calvinist and therein differed from his friend, John Wesley. Thirteen times he crossed the Atlantic in the days when crossings were long and perilous. His orphan home in Georgia was of great concern to him. His participation in the Great Awakening made it a highly significant movement in American religious history. Weary in the service of the Lord but not weary of it, worn out but not rusted out (to adapt his own phraseology), he died before he reached the age of 56. The Lord of the church uses his Whitefields and Weslevs as well as His Walthers and Wynekens.

Riecker's story is well told. The appendix contains letters written by Whitefield (pp. 175 to 210). The brief bibliography cites the *Works*, the *Sermons*, and the *Journals* of Whitefield and eight secondary authorities. There is no index. CARL S. MEYER

- CATHOLIC EVANGELICALISM. By Dieter Voll, translated from the German by Veronica Ruffer. London: Faith Press, 1963. 150 pages. Cloth. 15/-.
- HOCHKIRCHLICHER PIETISMUS. By Dieter Voll. Munich: Chr. Kaiser Verlag, 1960. 136 pages. Paper. DM 8.50.

The instructive subtitle of both the German original and the English translation of this Erlangen doctoral dissertation is the same: The Acceptance of Evangelical Traditions by the Oxford Movement During the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century, a Contribution Towards the Understanding of Recent Anglicanism. Hardly less instructive is the difference in the titles, with "Evangelicalism" reproducing Pietismus. Voll, instructor at the Lutheran Predigerseminar at Bayreuth, takes up Archbishop Yngve Brilioth's insight into "Tractarianism as the English counterpart of the contemporary Revival on the Continent and the Oxford Movement as the second phase of Evangelicalism, as the expression of a pietism that was again turning to the Church and its ordinances and its means of grace" (p. 120). After tracing the Evangelical Revival and the Oxford Movement side by side, Voll describes the coming together of the two traditions under the three heads of (1) the church and parish missions (Robert Aitken; Richard Meux Benson and the "Cowley Fathers"), (2) Bishop George Howard Wilkinson and his associates, and (3) Ritualistic Evangelicalism. The final part discusses the essence and the historical significance of "High Church Pietism"; in this section the chapter on "Anglican-Lutheran conversations" is of special interest. Voll makes a good case for his thesis, even though Bishop Stephen Neill is probably understating the case in saying in his foreword to the translation that "an English writer would not . . . have drawn quite the same picture of these events" (p.8). One might have wished that

Voll had included developments in the Protestant Episcopal Church in the U.S.A. In any case, American Lutherans, whose theology also represents a combination of pietism with the Catholic substance of Lutheran orthodoxy, can examine Voll's provocative study with profit.

## ARTHUR CARL PIEPKORN

PAUL ON PREACHING. By Jerome Murphy-O'Connor. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1963. 302 pages, indexes, and bibliography. Cloth. \$4.50.

This Roman Catholic specialist in Biblical studies, trained at the university of Fribourg and the Pontifical Biblical Institute in Rome, is evidently indebted to C. Spicq in this interesting Biblical theology of preaching with special reference to the epistles of St. Paul. The place of preaching in the plan of salvation, the preacher as God's instrument and as the extension of the ministry of Christ, the significance of the "Word of God," and preaching in and for the liturgical and sacrificial worship of the people are valuable accents. Method and findings are stimulating. RICHARD R. CAEMMERER

- QUELLEN ZUR GESCHICHTE DER DIA-KONIE. Edited by Herbert Krimm. Vol. II: Reformation und Neuzeit. Stuttgart: Evangelisches Verlagswerk, 1963. 534 pages. Half-cloth. DM 39.50.
- DAS DIAKONISCHE AMT DER KIRCHE IM ÖKUMENISCHEN BEREICH. Edited by Herbert Krimm. Stuttgart: Evangelisches Verlagswerk, 1960. 219 pages. Cloth. DM 22.00.

This journal reviewed the first volume of the *Quellen* in Vol.XXXII (1961), 376. The second volume exhibits the same thorough reportage of the sources. The era of the Reformation is covered by excerpts from Luther, Zwingli, Bucer, Calvin, and 11 contemporary records from 16th-century church orders and confessions, the 17th century by

346

excerpts chiefly from John Gerhard, Gisbert Voetius, Guy Louis von Seckendorff, Caspar Ziegler, William Zepper, Gellert, Pestalozzi, Spener, Francke and the Herrnhut Unitas. The revival of diaconic concern and activity is illustrated at the hand of materials from and about Oberlin, Louise Scheppler, Falk, Adalbert von der Recke-Volmarstein, Christian Henry Zeller and their contemporaries, the great Johann Hinrich Wichern and Theodore Fliedner, and the social reformer Gustave Werner. The work of the Innere Mission is a major chapter, as is the renewal of the institutional diaconate through Francis Henry Härter, the Monbijou Conference (1856), Löhe, and Frederick Zimmer. The final chapter provides documents relating to the "social question" as German Lutheran and Reformed Christianity faced it; here the chief points of reference are individuals like Adolf Stöcker, Frederick von Bodelschwingh, and Frederick Naumann and organizations like the Christian-Social Labor Party, the Evangelical Social Congress, and the Kirchlich-soziale Konferenz. Appendices catalog Roman Catholic influences originating with (among others) Charles Borromeo, Vincent de Paul, and Leo XIII (Rerum novarum) and English influences exemplified by Elizabeth Fry and Florence Nightingale. The total is a well-balanced collection that is of immense historical and practical value. By his conscientious and careful work Krimm has put us all in his debt.

Das diakonische Amt in a sense complements and extends the larger work. In it leaders of diaconic activity in Denmark, Finland, Norway, Sweden, the Lutheran and Reformed Churches of France, and the Dutch Reformed Church trace the past history and the present status of diaconal work in their respective areas of Europe. The final chapter is a highly useful and perceptive description of diaconic service in the churches of the United States by E. Theodore Bachmann.

ARTHUR CARL PIEPKORN

RABBINISCHE TEXTE. First Series: Die Tosefta: Text, Übersetzung und Erklärung. Edited by Gerhard Kittel and Karl Heinrich Rengstorf. Vol. 6,1: Seder Toharot; edited by Walter Windfuhr; 1952-60; German text, 446 pages; Hebrew text, 184 pages; paper, DM 57.00. Vol. 2: Seder Naschim: Jebamot; edited by Karl Heinrich Rengstorf; 1953; German text, 132 pages; Hebrew text, 56 pages; paper; DM 18.00. Vol. 1: Seder Seraim: Berakot and Pea; edited by Eduard Lohse, Günther Schlichting, and Karl Heinrich Rengstorf; 1956-58; German text, 112 pages; Hebrew text, 64 pages; paper; DM 18.00. Vol. 6,2: Seder Toharot: Para; edited by Walter Windfuhr; 1962; German text, 48 pages; Hebrew text, 16 pages; paper; DM 7.50. Second Series: Tannaitische Midraschim: Übersetzung und Erklärung. Vol. 3: Sifre zu Numeri; by Karl Georg Kuhn; 1959; xxiv and 831 pages; cloth, DM 78.00. Vol. 4: Sifre zu Deuteronomium. Fascicle 1: Deut. 1:1-6:4: by Henrik Ljungman; 1964; 80 pages; paper; DM 12.00. Stuttgart: W. Kohlhammer Verlag.

This publication of Jewish Tannaitic tradition, whose origins often extend as far back as the time of the primitive Christian church, makes a welcomed and long-awaited appearance in the area of rabbinic studies and the discipline of comparative religions.

The double series of texts composes two classes of rabbinic literature, the *Tosefta* in the first series and the Tannaitic Midrashim in the second series. The plan for the publication of both series originated about the year 1930. The intention was to offer a Hebrew text of the *Tosefta* and modern translations of both series and, through the addition of supplementary explanatory notes, to relate this material to extra-Judaic and particularly to Christian literature. Begun in 1933 under the editorship of Kittel, this plan unfortunately came to a premature halt in 1937. After World War II work was resumed under the editorship of Rengstorf, a professor of New Testament exegesis at the University of Münster-in-Westfalen and director of the Institutum Judaicum Delitzschianum.

Within the first series, the Tosefta, which includes a fresh edition of the Hebrew text, a translation, and commentary, the first item to appear was Windfuhr's Seder Toharot (published part by part from 1952 to 1960). This was followed by Rengstorf's Jebamot within Seder Naschim (1953) and by the edition of Berakot within Seder Seraim by Lohse and Schlichting (1956-58). In June 1962 Windfuhr released the first section of Para within the second half of Seder Toharot. Ljungman's first fascicle of a translation of and commentary upon the Tannaitic tradition concerning the Biblical book of Deuteronomy is the latest representative of the second series, the Tannaitic Midrashim. This work provides a companion to the splendid edition of the Sifre zu Numeri (Vol. 3) produced by Heidelberg professor K. G. Kuhn in 1959.

The latest works in these two series correspond commendably to the quality and high caliber of their predecessors. The text in the case of the *Tosefta* has been edited with care, as the critical apparatus will attest; the translations are accurate and lucid. The textual format of the Midrashim clearly distinguishes between the Biblical verse and the exposition.

That this entire series is a noteworthy contribution to Old and New Testament scholarship is demonstrated by the abundance of Biblical references and illustrative material contained in the notes below each page of text translation, and in the excursuses. Scholars seeking information, for instance, on the simile of the beam and the splinter in Matt. 7:3 ff., or on the Jewish attitude to the Law and the situation reflected in Matt. 11:18 f. and parallels, or on the significance of "mountain" in the theological conception of both Jewish and Christian communities would do well to note the material offered by Ljungman in the footnotes on pages 2, 30, and 67 respectively. Anyone interested in the Jewish estimation of Paul would profit from Excursus III of Kuhn's work on Nu-meri.

When complete, this treatment of rabbinic expository material from the first three Christian centuries promises to represent a basic reference work for both rabbinic and Biblical scholars. One of the most eminent of all New Testament scholars, Adolf Schlatter, the exegetical giant to whom the Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament is dedicated, found the clue to much of the "riddle of the New Testament" in the traditions of rabbinic interpretation. Now at the hand of basic texts such as these, no man with a basic training in Hebrew need satisfy himself with anything less than the sources themselves. JOHN H. ELLIOTT

REASON AND REVELATION IN RICH-ARD HOOKER. By Gunnar Hillerdal. Lund: CWK Gleerup, 1962. 150 pages. Paper. 20.00 Swedish Kronor.

Hooker (c. 1554-1600) was called "par excellence the apologist of the Elizabethan Settlement of 1559 and perhaps the most accomplished advocate that Anglicanism has ever had." His Treatise on the Laws of Ecclesiastical Polity opposed Puritan literalism in the interpretation of the Scriptures. The relationships between faith and knowledge were important to Hooker. To him natural law is the expression of God's supreme reason and complements the Scriptures. He can reconcile reason and revelation for the believer only by requiring the submission of reason under revelation. His dependence on Thomas Aquinas for his metaphysics must be recognized. Hillerdal explores Hooker's and Luther's concepts of justice.

Hillerdal has made a penetrating study of Hooker's thought and provides a perceptive guide to his theology. CARL S. MEYER

FAITH AND A GOOD CONSCIENCE: Papers Read at the Puritan and Reformed Studies Conference, 18th and 19th December 1962. London: Evangelical Magazine (Providence House), 1963. 80 pages. Paper. 3/6.

Five of the six papers read at the 1962 London Puritan and Reformed Studies Conference are here presented. The first of the essays deals with William Perkins and the origins of Puritan casuistry. The outstanding paper in the collection comes next, that by J. I. Packer, "The Puritan Conscience." In the other papers Thomas Boston of Ettrich and John Owen are discussed, the latter on the person and work of Christ. Entwistle's treatment of Owen's Christological views is noteworthy. A bit of Puritan history from 1640 to 1662 concludes the essays. This reviewer found the essays very useful for gaining added insight into Puritan CARL S. MEYER theology.

THE FIVE AGES OF MAN: THE PSY-CHOLOGY OF HUMAN HISTORY. By Gerald Heard. New York: The Julian Press, 1963. viii and 393 pages. Cloth. \$8.50.

Heard is all in favor of man. He believes that man can transform his own nature, and he finds a 5-stage evolution of man. Neatly he speaks of the five crises, the psychological story of social man; the five ordeals, the personal psychological story of man; the five mysteries, the development of initiations of psychophysical religious exercises. The book is well written. It will have a limited appeal among Lutheran clergymen and even less endorsement. CARL S. MEYER

MINNESOTA: A HISTORY OF THE STATE. By Theodore C. Blegen. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1963. xiv and 688 pages. Cloth. \$8.50.

Blegen has put together a fascinating story of a great state. He places Minnesota in its geographical setting, tells about the explorations, and recounts the settlements there. One chapter he entitles "Preachers, Word Hunters, Teachers." In another chapter about education he tells about the parochial schools among the Lutherans and about some of the colleges which they sponsored. He has a brief reference to Lutheran church mergers. The book is nicely illustrated and stands out as an example of the printer's art.

## CARL S. MEYER

SYNOPSE DE MATTHIEU, MARC ET LUC AVEC LES PARALLELES DE JEAN. By Lucien Deiss. Vol. 2: Texte. Tournai: Desclée de Brouwer, 1963. 327 pages. Cloth. Price not given.

This work, similar in format to the Greek Synopsis of Huck-Lietzmann, is the first synopsis following the order of all four gospels to appear in modern French translation. The Roman Catholic editor, professor of Sacred Scripture and dogmatic theology at Chevilly-Larue, has been a leader in Scriptural as well as liturgical studies in France and is director of the New Testament section of the collection *Connaitre la Bible*, in which this work appears.

The synopsis presents the texts of the first three gospels. However, sections from the fourth gospel are given where this gospel is directly parallel to the other three. No extensive apparatus containing textual variants is offered. Rather only a selection of the most significant variants as well as some of the most important parallels are given in the footnotes.

The appearance of Kurt Aland's Synopsis, which contains the parallel texts of all four gospels, has rendered the previous tripartite division of Huck-Lietzmann and Deiss somewhat obsolete. Nevertheless, the observations contained in Deiss' edition, particularly the titles which he has assigned the various pericopes, merit the attention of those concerned with the "Synoptic Problem."

## John H. Elliott

NEW TESTAMENT TOOLS AND STUD-IES. Edited by Bruce M. Metzger. Volume III: GREEK PARTICLES IN THE NEW TESTAMENT. By Margaret E. Thrall. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1962. viii and 107 pages. Cloth. \$4.00.

Special exegetical concerns prompted the writing of this work on selected particles and combinations of particles in the New Testament. The largest proportion of space is given to πλήν and (τό) λοιπόν. Miss Thrall claims that  $\pi\lambda\eta\nu$  "develops a purely adversative function" in addition to its "exceptive use" (p. 20). However, in one of her "clear examples," Matt. 18:7, the particle may well be rendered "only." In the case of Luke 19:27, instead of "and, what is more," we may render, "rather" (compare 6:35; 11:41; 12:31). The usage in Luke 10:14 may be similar. In a separate section reserved for discussion of several verses which entail special difficulties for interpreters, Miss Thrall discusses the meaning of πλήν in Matt. 26:64 and concludes that here it bears an "asseverative" force. She interprets: "Yes, I am. Indeed I tell you that you will see me immediately vindicated" (p. 78). However, the rendering "only" does justice to the passage. Jesus is saying: "The words are yours. Only I tell you . . ." In brief, Jesus says that they are obviously trying to incriminate Him. He is the Christ, but not in the way they interpret the title in His case. However, He will be vindicated.

Miss Thrall's interpretation of  $\pi\lambda\dot{\eta}\nu$  in Matt. 26:39, "on condition that," obscures somewhat the exceptive factor, "Only not as I wish, but as You wish." The lengthy discussion of  $d\lambda\lambda'$  el xal in 1 Cor. 7:21 terminates in the conclusion that Paul advises Christian slaves to accept the opportunity of freedom. An examination of 2 Cor. 5:1-10 convinces Miss Thrall that there is no reference to a fear of disembodiment at death. Just criticisms are made of C. H. Bird's thesis of an affirmative use of  $\gamma\dot{\alpha}q$  employed by Mark in an allusive sense and of Max Zerwick's view of Mark's alleged "psychological" use of  $\delta \dot{\epsilon}$ .

This is a worthy volume and its value as a tool to the student of the New Testament will become evident as he finds his sensitivity to the meanings of particles sharpened by its use. FREDERICK W. DANKER

# BOOK NOTES

#### SOME BOOKS ON VATICAN II

Pope John and the Ecumenical Council: A Diary of the Second Vatican Council, September—December 1962. By Carlo Falconi, translated from the Italian by Muriel Grindrod. Cleveland: The World Publishing Company, 1964. 373 pages. Cloth. \$5.95. Falconi, an Italian lay journalist and historian of culture, bases this account of the first phase of Vatican II on his own diary, on the daily newspaper accounts in which he crystallized his impressions, and on information that he was able to obtain from both official and confidential sources. His long experience and broad background give him an exceptional frame of reference within which to evaluate the individual developments in the council, and he writes with a considerable degree of keen perceptiveness and authority. Both for fact and for interpretation his report deserves very careful attention.

A New Pentecost — Vatican Council II: Session 1. By Vincent A. Yzermans. Westminster, Md.: The Newman Press, 1963. x and 376 pages, plus 14 pages of plates. Cloth. \$6.50. Hans Küng's foreword accu-

rately appraises Yzermans' account as that of a Roman Catholic priest-journalist more concerned about interpreting the council accurately to Americans of his own and of other denominations than about providing "a profound historical, theological, and pastoral analysis" (p. xix). The book is an expansion of articles that appeared weekly in five Roman Catholic periodicals. Its value lies not only in Yzermans' incontestable skill as an observer, questioner, and reporter but also in the documents that he appends liberally throughout the book and in the splendid photographic illustrations. A measure of the author's generosity of heart is the fact that he concludes his first chapter with a prayer of Martin Luther!

Letters from Vatican City - Vatican Council II (First Session): Background and Debates. By Xavier Rynne [pseudonym]. New York: Farrar, Straus and Cudahy, 1963. xiii and 289 pages. Cloth. \$3.95. The identity of the author and the reliability of these "letters" - expanded from the original two provocative epistles that appeared in the New Yorker --- continue to evoke debate. At least one Roman Catholic prelate who was at the sessions that "Rynne" describes characterizes the book both as a scandalous and oversimplified "monument of indiscretion" and as "an incredibly well-documented piece" based on notes taken "with great skill and acumen." Another prelate suggests that "Rynne" worked primarily with the accounts of the council that "appeared in certain French and Italian newspapers which were notorious for the 'ingenuity' of their reporters." He notes partisan bias and prejudice in this "essay in theological journalism," and while he deftly refuses to comment on the accuracy of "Rynne's" reporting he recommends these letters to "those who were present at the council" as "useful for ready reference." ("The Xavier Rynne Book," America, No. 2818 [June 29, 1963], pp. 906 and 907) Those who were not at the council have been finding the letters instructive too!

The Johannine Council: Witness to Unity (Konzil im Zeichen der Einheit). By Bernard Häring, translated by Edwin G. Kaiser. New

York: Herder and Herder, 1963. 155 pages. Cloth. \$3.50. Redemptorist Häring is one of the most respected German Roman Catholic theologians of this century. His book is not so much a chronicle of the council as an interpretation of the first phase, which Häring treats ecclesiologically from the angle of: (1) The mystery of unity; (2) the concerns of the council in the light of the mystery of unity; and (3) the conversion of all Christians to unity. Joseph Cardinal Ritter sees Häring as "beautifully and yet succinctly explain[ing] the council in this perspective" (p.7). Non-Roman Catholics will find chapter 11, "The Mystery of Unity Among Our Separated Brethren," of special interest.

The Council in Action: Theological Reflections on the Second Vatican Council. By Hans Küng, translated from the German by Cecily Hastings. New York: Sheed and Ward, 1963. ix and 276 pages. Cloth. \$4.50. Küng, whose own stature was immensely heightened at Vatican II, himself describes this work as a kind of continuation of his earlier The Council, Reform and Reunion. Written at the end of the council's first phase, the book's 17 chapters are distributed over five parts: (1) The council's program; (2) the council in theory and practice; (3) carrying out the program; (4) matters of doctrine; and (5) the church in the present age. The uncompromisingly positive tone of the book reflects Küng's confidence in his assumptions, his method-"The Second ology, and his conclusions. Vatican Council comes four hundred years too late" (p. 32). "The opening ceremony, with its completely noncontemporary Baroque pomp . . . was one more case of having to deplore the passing over by traditionalists of good old Catholic traditions in favor of other ideas of no long standing" (pp. 67 and 68). The first phase was "a good beginning, better than anyone had ever expected" (p. 78). In the Mass of the future "the Eucharistic prayer, including the words of consecration, should be said intelligibly and aloud" (p. 105). "Certain obvious facts make it clear that Latin is not 'the mother tongue of the Church'" (p. 123): "It has not been spoken since the earliest times"; it "is not universally spoken within the Church"; it "is not intelligible"; it "is not a matter of faith" (pp. 123-132). The exegete will read with great interest the chapter "Early Catholicism' in the New Testament as a Problem in Controversial Theology," the systematician the chapter "The Petrine Office and the Apostolic Office," the missiologist "The Missions in the Ecumenical Age."

Structures of the Church (Strukturen der Kirche). By Hans Küng, translated by Salvator Attanasio. New York: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1964. xviii and 394 pages. Cloth. \$7.50. This volume should be read along with The Council in Action, although Küng wrote it before Vatican II as a kind of learned companion piece to The Council. Reform and Reunion in order to develop a theology of ecumenical councils. The documentation is so formidable as to be likely to deter all but the most determined gainsaver. (Per accidens, the same documentation makes the book a bibliographical goldmine.) In one sense, the book is a debate with Luther. Küng argues that the real divinely convoked ecumenical council is the church itself and that a council is only a representation of the one holy catholic and apostolic church. Its significance depends on whether it is a credible or noncredible representation. To be credible it must reflect the universal priesthood of believers, that is, it must include the laity, but it must also reflect the apostolicity of the church and take cognizance of the hierarchical structure that is also ecclesiologically given. The last two sections, "The Petrine Office in the Church and in Councils" and "What Does Infallibility Mean?" will appear noteworthy for the clarity of their historical and systematic analysis even to those who dissent from some of the final conclusions. Quite apart from its significance for an understanding of Vatican II, this work has an independent importance that it shares with the author's *Rechtfertigung* and that commends it to the serious theologian of every denomination. That being so, the publishers are to be chided for not providing an index.

Vatican II: Last of the Councils. By Rock Caporale. Baltimore: Helicon Press, 1964. 192 pages. Cloth. \$4.95. The title as it stands is misleading; in order not to convey a false impression it ought to be expanded to read: Vatican II, (Second Phase): {A Sociological Inquiry into the} La{te}st of the {"Modern" Western} Councils (in the Series Initiated by Lateran I); it is only in the last chapter that Caporale lays aside his tables and sociograms and essays the role of prophet. In its own right, without the last chapter, this book is a useful supplement that adds a dimension of depth to any report on Vatican II and especially on the second phase. Caporale, a fully qualified Jesuit priest-sociologist, had no official connection with the council, but, as Bishop John Wright points out in the foreword, "he was present to study some of the human reactions and relations" of some typical Council participants (pp. 5-6). Seventy-three prelates cardinals, archbishops, and bishops - and seventeen observers (including six non-Roman Catholics) cooperated in an extensive program of interviews which are the stuff from which this book is fashioned. The price of obtaining the information was the anonymity of the persons interviewed, so that the reader must make an act of faith in Caporale's ability and fair-mindedness. It can be supposed that every participant in the council heard the things that this book contains; Caporale brought to the hearing a trained ear and a trained mind that he generously shares with stay-at-homes.

Observer in Rome: A Protestant Report on the Vatican Council. By Robert McAfee Brown. Garden City, N. Y.: Doubleday and Company, 1964. xii and 271 pages. Cloth. \$4.95. Stanford's ecumenically oriented Brown attended the second phase of Vatican II as observer for the Presbyterian and Reformed World Alliance. His forthright, sympathetic but not uncritical, good-humored and swiftly paced chronicle, based on a carefully kept diary, is one of the best and fairest extended descriptions in English of what took place in the 1963 phase of the council. ARTHUR CARL PIEPKORN

352