

CONCORDIA THEOLOGICAL QUARTERLY



Volume 72:4

October 2008

Table of Contents

Editorial	290
God Did Not Create Death: Athanasius on the Atonement William C. Weinrich.....	291
Contemporary Views on Atonement in Light of the Lutheran Confessions Naomichi Masaki.....	305
Justification: The Stumbling Block of the Finnish Luther School Timo Laato.....	327
Jonathan Edwards on Justification by Faith Lawrence R. Rast Jr.	347
Theological Observer	363
Martin Stephan: The Other Side of the Story or At Least Part of It Religious Belief in the USA: The Need for Creedal Christianity	
Book Reviews	368
Indices for 2008	382

Book Reviews

Awakening to Equality: A Young White Pastor at the Dawn of Civil Rights. By Karl E. Lutze. Columbia, MO: University of Missouri Press, 2006. 176 pages. Hardcover. \$29.95.

Karl E. Lutze, a 1945 graduate of Concordia Seminary, St. Louis, faced a not uncommon reality for seminary graduates in the 1940s. His first assignment was, in part, as a missionary-at-large. No surprises there. Nor was his assignment to a young (less than a decade old), struggling mission community in Muskogee, Oklahoma, a surprise. What was different for him—completely different—was that he, a young white man, was assigned to serve an African-American congregation in the American South. *Awakening to Equality* is his story of serving as a pastor in chiefly African-American settings as the United States was just beginning to come to terms with institutionalized racism and its expression in legally-enforced segregation.

Lutze describes his awakening as a pilgrimage from a childhood and young adulthood lived almost entirely apart from African Americans (Sheboygan, Wisconsin), to the pastorate of an almost all-black mission congregation (Muskogee, Oklahoma), finally to the pastorate of an integrated congregation (Tulsa, Oklahoma). The narrative that unfolds follows Lutze from his early ministry as he becomes aware of the pervasive character of segregation, which defined the lives of African Americans in this period, and of how the church had been unresponsive to such patterns. Lutze largely leaves the narrative off with his move in 1959 from Tulsa to the Lutheran Human Relations Association of America at Valparaiso University in Indiana, where he worked with Andrew Schultze, the pioneering advocate of racial equality. However, Lutze does note that, over the course of his more than decade-long ministry in Oklahoma, the patterns of segregation began to change and have continued to change, though Lutze believes much remains to be done. "Everything's different, but nothing has changed," said one of his colleagues in assessment (163). Lutze's own assessment is blunt: "The full promises of an ideal community that cares for all of its people have not yet been met—in Oklahoma and in countless other places" (164).

Lutze's commitments are clear. As such, it is surprising that some inconsistencies appear in the work. For example, Lutze is critical of the Synodical Conference's mission approach, in which it seemed to create a "separate but equal" mission to African Americans (a point others rightly have made). This segregationist perspective, he observes, is also illustrated by the fact that white pastors serving black congregations were paid more than black pastors who served similar or even the same congregations. Further, officials in the Synodical Conference (all white) exercised a heavy hand in organizing the mission efforts of pastors (white and black) and congregations—a classic top-down approach that did not empower either the pastors or the

congregations. Lutze's critique is well stated. However, he does not level the same critique at the Oklahoma District of the LCMS, which, as described by Lutze, itself effected and affected the organization of the integrated congregation, the Lutheran Church of the Prince of Peace, which took Lutze from Muskogee to North Tulsa, seemingly apart from any input from the wishes of the Muskogee congregation (92). True, Lutze does on occasion critique LCMS officials and the general perspective of the LCMS (as an example, see his comments on LCMS president John W. Behnken on page 110), but perhaps the pervasive character of such perspectives is lost even on its critics.

The book has a few minor typographical errors in it. One that repeats itself regularly is the failure to capitalize The Lutheran Church—Missouri Synod. There also is a tendency toward repetition, which is not uncharacteristic of this genre of literature. Nonetheless, this is a significant and illuminating book. Readers interested in the life of congregations during a dynamic time of change in American society and in the LCMS will appreciate this volume.

Lawrence R. Rast Jr.

***The Cambridge Companion to Jonathan Edwards.* Edited by Stephen J. Stein. Cambridge Companions to Religion. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007. 398 pages. Paperback. \$27.99.**

Jonathan Edwards is best known for his sermon "Sinners in the Hands of an Angry God," in which God is depicted as holding sinners over the fires of hell as one would hold a spider on a thin thread. Hellfire and brimstone preaching aside, there is a lot more to Edwards than this one sermon, and *The Cambridge Companion to Jonathan Edwards* promises to provide a more-balanced view of Edwards himself and the wider world of Edwards study. The book is a collection of essays that "seeks to open for . . . the reader the life and times of Edwards, his religious and professional achievements, and the full range of his reputation in diverse fields" (8). Editor Stephen Stein accomplishes this goal by organizing the essays into three main parts. The book begins with a group of essays on Edward's life and context, followed by a group examining his roles and achievements. The concluding essays all deal with his legacy and reputation.

Stein makes clear that these essays do not offer the final word on Edwards or his place in history. As a result of his complexity, no single interpretation of Edwards dominates the book. Not only did Edwards leave behind a vast collection of writings, the writings themselves are so varied that they thwart easy generalizations. This has caused some to claim Edwards as a theologian, while others prefer to downplay his theology and see him as a philosopher or even just a producer of early American literature. Edwards was, of course, all of these at the same time, and more, which is one of the reasons that he is

worthy of this kind of attention some three hundred years after his birth. Even if one were limited to Edwards as theologian, the questions do not end. He has been viewed as the last Puritan and the first Evangelical. He has been claimed by Calvinists, Revivalists, and Unitarians as one of their own, and even today he remains one of the seminal figures in American church history.

The contributors are a veritable "Who's Who" of Edwards scholars. Standout essays include George Marsden's "Biography," Harry Stout's "Edwards as Revivalist," Wilson Kinnach's "Edwards as Preacher," Stephen Stein's "Edwards as Biblical Exegete," and Stephen Crocco's "Edwards's Intellectual Legacy." *The Cambridge Companion* serves as an excellent introduction to contemporary interpretations of Jonathan Edwards. In addition to the essays, it also provides a full listing of the Yale edition of *The Work of Jonathan Edwards* (including forthcoming volumes), as well as an extensive bibliography of further reading.

Grant A. Knepper
Pastor, Zion Lutheran Church
Hillsboro, Oregon

***Introduction to Modern Theology: Trajectories in the German Tradition.* By John E. Wilson. Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2007. 286 pages. Paperback. \$29.95.**

John E. Wilson, professor of church history at Pittsburgh Theological Seminary, undertakes a daunting task, namely, tracing trajectories of German trends as a way of charting out the course of contemporary theology. The value of the book is also its weakness. After a brief historical overview that begins with the Revolution of 1848 and continues through the period immediately after World War I, Wilson provides clear introductions to Kant, Hegel, Schelling, Kierkegaard, and Schleiermacher and their formative influence in nineteenth- and twentieth-century theology. In keeping with the subtitle of the book, he extends the trajectory from Germany to America in the thinking of Emerson. There are extended treatments of so-called "Mediation Theology" (for example, Tholuck, Dorner, and Baur) and Ritschlianism (for example, Ritschl, Hermann, Adolph Harnack, Troeltsch, and Otto). The antecedents of dialectic theology are found in Martin Kähler and Franz Overbeck. As one would expect, a significant portion of the book is devoted to Karl Barth, Emil Brunner, Rudolph Bultmann, Dietrich Bonhoeffer, Paul Tillich, and the Niebuhr brothers. The trajectory from Germany to America runs from Walter Rauschenbusch to Martin Luther King, Jr., and various forms of liberation theology.

Wilson's concise and generally helpful summations of theologians and their theologies finally fail to give a comprehensive picture of contemporary trends. For example, there is only scant treatment of the confessional reawakening of

the nineteenth century and nothing on confessional theologians of the twentieth century (Elert, Schlink, Peter Brunner, and Iwand). Paul Althaus is mentioned only in relationship to his alleged complicity with National Socialism. J. C. K. von Hoffman is completely ignored, as is the leading figure in the Luther Renaissance, Karl Holl. The volume ends with German theology in the 1960s (Sölle, Moltmann, Pannenberg, and Jüngel), so genuinely contemporary figures such as Oswald Bayer and Gerhard Sauter are also absent. Apart from the section on Bultmann and Ebeling, there is little about the theological impact of biblical scholars such as von Rad (in Old Testament) or Käsemann (in New Testament) on systematic theology.

If one is looking for a comprehensive guide to contemporary theology, *Introduction to Modern Theology: Trajectories in the German Tradition* would not be the place to look. Hans Schwarz's *Theology in Global Context: the Last Two Hundred Years* (Eerdmans, 2005) would be a more adequate choice. However, those interested in probing the philosophical background of major movements in German theology in the last century will be assisted by this volume. In that sense it might be best used as a supplement to two older works: Karl Barth's *Protestant Theology in the Nineteenth Century: Its Background and History* (reprint; Eerdmans, 2001) and Helmut Thielicke's *Modern Faith and Thought* (Eerdmans, 1990).

John T. Pless

***Educating People of Faith: Exploring the History of Jewish and Christian Communities.* Edited by John Van Engen. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2004. 366 pages. Paperback. \$34.00.**

"The church is always more than a school but the church cannot be less than a school," writes Jaroslav Pelikan (ix). This anthology of essays examines the ways that teaching and learning are woven into the fabric of the church's communal life in several historical and cultural contexts. Robert Goldenburg ("Religious Formation in Ancient Judaism"), Elliot Wolfson ("Orality, Textuality, and Revelation as Modes of Education and Formation in Jewish Mystical Circles of the High Middle Ages") treat religious education in Jewish history. John Van Engen, the editor, contributes a programmatic essay, "Formative Religious Practices in Premodern European Life," that seeks to apply rigorous historical methodology to discern the "lived religion" of the past and suggest ways in which this research might yield a "usable past" to believers in our time (1). All of the essays investigate expressions of religious formation prior to the end of the sixteenth century.

The first section of the book is devoted to early synagogue and church. In this section, Robert Louis Wilken's chapter on "Christian Formation in the Early Church" stands out as he explores the multi-level context of early church practices in Greco-Roman and Judaic worlds. Wilken notes that "Judaism's

greatest contribution to Christianity's understanding of moral and spiritual formation was not institutional but theological" (51). Tracing the place of texts, liturgy, and social relations (family, master-disciple, friendship), Wilken concludes: "What gave Christian formation its power and tenacity was that it was carried out within the context of a coherent theological framework. It was also thoroughly biblical and philosophically astute. People knew why they did what they did" (62). John Cavadini's study of Augustine argues that for the Bishop of Hippo "faith is the healing of the eye of the mind and, as such, a capacity for understanding or 'penetrating' mystery" (79). "Monastic Formation and Christian Practice: Food in the Desert" by Blake Leyerle examines eating and fasting habits that were part of the transformation envisioned in early monasticism.

Six essays are devoted to Jewish and Christian practices of religious education in the Middle Ages. Stanley Samuel Harakas surveys practices of liturgy, catechesis, and iconography in the Christian east, concluding that the key to the Byzantine approach is formation of the Christian consciousness and lifestyle in adherence with the Holy Tradition. Other essays in this section deal with the place of the cult of the Virgin Mary in Christian formation, practices in thirteenth-century England, and Jewish mysticism.

The final section of the book is devoted to the Reformation era. David C. Steinmetz provides the chapter on Luther, titled "Luther and the Formation in Faith." Steinmetz observes that Luther and his colleagues faced a task that in large measure was unprecedented. They had not only to pass on the faith to a new generation; they had "to re-form an older generation that had in their estimation been formed in the Christian faith incorrectly" (253). The Reformation was not only a theological movement but also a reforming of piety and practices. Steinmetz rightly notes the influence of Luther's catechisms in this regard. Lee Palmer Wandel writes on "Zwingli and Reformed Practice," tracing reforms in worship as a means of establishing Christian identity. Robert M. Kingdom looks at institutional developments as an embodiment of Calvin's version of Christianity in his essay "Catechesis in Calvin's Geneva." The final two essays deal with late-Reformation Roman Catholic practices: ritual (Philip Soergel) and spiritual direction as pedagogy (Lawrence Cunningham).

With a renewed interest in classical forms of catechesis, this volume is a helpful guard against a romantic attempt to return to a golden age. The essays in *Educating People of Faith* provide Christian educators with a wealth of historical and cultural research on how Christians have transmitted the faith in a variety of times and places.

The Pentateuch: A Story of Beginnings. By Paula Gooder. London and New York: T&T Clark International, 2005. 128 pages. Paperback. \$34.95.

Paula Gooder, Canon Theologian of Birmingham Cathedral and an Honorary Lecturer at the University of Birmingham, introduces her book with the obvious statement that "Beginnings are important." She continues:

Beginnings are important not simply because they describe how things used to be but because they can also point to how things might be. This is especially true of the accounts of beginnings found in the Bible. They not only describe how the world came to be but also point to the on-going relationship between God and humanity. The accounts were intended to be not so much informative as inspirational. They aimed to open a window on to how the world might be in relationship with the God who began the world and who continually intervenes in its history. (1)

All of this is true and intriguing. The whole of the Pentateuch is a description not simply of the creation but also of the beginnings of the people of God. Therefore, the theme of beginnings, or creation, is found not only in the formation of the world but also in the formation of Israel as the people of God. The first five books of Scripture end with a beginning as the covenantal people of God stand on the banks of the Jordan River preparing to begin a new life as God's people in the land that he promised.

The author's purpose, as stated in her introduction, is to explore the Pentateuch as a narrative of beginnings in more than one sense. Unfortunately, she never accomplishes this purpose. While giving her stated intent cursory attention, she fractures her theme. The author's beginning statement of purpose never comes to fruition; however, she does accomplish her statement of purpose as set down in her concluding remarks. Unfortunately, they are not identical.

While Gooder says that the ending is but a beginning, her beginning is most certainly the ending of her opening theme. Still, she does accomplish a different goal. She provides a concise and well-written account of various ways of reading the texts. Her book introduces the reader to some of the many approaches to the Pentateuch and does provide a useful guide with which to begin a study of the texts.

The book offers a concise overview of the various approaches to the text of the Pentateuch that provides useful information without bogging down in minutia. Source and form criticism, as well as oral tradition, are explained in a succinct manner along with the more current trend to abandon the attempt to understand the origins of the Pentateuch in favor of understanding it in its present form. She also gives a brief yet excellent explanation of "myth" in the context of the biblical text (25-26).

In regard to the Documentary Hypothesis, one of her statements is especially provocative and insightful:

This theory is so influential that a whole host of different theories have grown out of it. Indeed, it is somewhat ironic that the current crisis which surrounds the hypothesis is as much due to the theories that set out to support it as to those that set out to criticize it. The wealth of proposals and counter-proposals that developed out of the original theory are now so complex that the hypothesis struggles to survive. (14)

This is well stated and demonstrates a careful observation of the current academic environment in which modern Pentateuch studies are carried out.

While Gooder does not accomplish the stated purpose in her opening, she has provided us with a useful resource for quick review and overview of Pentateuch studies. She did not end where she began, or begin where she ended, but in the end the journey was interesting.

Jeffrey H. Pulse

The Preexistent Son: Recovering the Christologies of Matthew, Mark, and Luke. By Simon J. Gathercole. Grand Rapids and Cambridge, U.K.: Eerdmans, 2006. 344 pages. Paperback. \$34.00.

When considering what the New Testament proclaims about the preexistence of the Son, it is the testimony of the Gospel of John and the Pauline Epistles that usually comes to mind, and certainly not much from the Synoptic Gospels. Simon Gathercole, formerly teaching at Aberdeen and now at the University of Cambridge, tackles the daunting task of challenging this common misperception that is also the scholarly consensus. He does this by presenting wide-ranging and fresh evidence for the preexistence of the Son from the Gospels of Matthew, Mark, and Luke. The result is one of the most intriguing books on early preexistence Christology that I have ever read.

Gathercole begins by presenting a very short survey—even too brief—of research on New Testament evidence of the Son's preexistence under three headings: Representatives of the Consensus; The Optimists; and the New History of Religions School. Although his overview demonstrates the strong consensus against seeing evidence of preexistence in the Synoptic Gospels, he also argues that scholars from the so-called New History of Religions School, like Larry Hurtado and Richard Bauckham, are "acknowledging that the portrayal of Christ in the Gospels in fact shows strong signs of including heavenly and divine contours to Christ's identity" (17). Gathercole follows a similar approach as these two scholars: careful historical research on New Testament texts in the wider context of Second Temple Judaism.

The primary thesis of this book is that the "I have come" (ἦλθον) sayings in the Synoptic Gospels are significant evidence for the preexistence of Jesus as

the Son. If Jesus is speaking of having come to the present place at this particular moment, the natural questions arise: *Where* did he come from, and *when* was he there? Gathercole proposes that these statements imply Jesus existed *prior* to his conception in the *heavenly* realm. Before Gathercole begins arguing his thesis, he presents two chapters of prolegomena. The first demonstrates that preexistence Christology was already widespread before AD 70 as evinced in the Pauline Epistles, Hebrews, and Jude. This chapter helps one to read the evidence from the Gospels in a pre-70 context where the Son's preexistence is already the subject of Christian thought and writing. The other chapter introduces the theme of Jesus' transcendence in the Synoptic Gospels. He concludes that "a heavenly christology is not a distinctively Johannine phenomena: There are plenty of thunderbolts throughout Matthew, Mark, and Luke as well" (79).

The main body of the book is a careful examination of the ten sayings in the Synoptic Gospels that contain or are related to Jesus' assertion "I have come" (Mark 1:24=Luke 4:34; Matt 8:29; Mark 1:38, cf. Luke 4:43; Mark 2:17=Matt 9:13=Luke 5:32; Matt 5:17; Luke 12:49; Matt 10:34=Luke 12:51; and Matt 10:35). Gathercole first reviews how other interpreters have understood these phrases: an idiom of a Hellenistic prophet; an Aramaic idiom for "I am here"; a signal of Jesus' origins from Nazareth; a statement of Jesus' status as a prophet of Israel; a statement of Jesus' coming as Messiah; and an epiphany statement. Seeing these understandings as deficient, Gathercole proposes that these statements are evidence of Jesus' preexistence in the heavenly realm. The primary support for his proposal is similar pronouncements by angels in biblical and Second Temple Jewish literature. The statements indicate that the angel has come from the heavenly realm and existed prior to becoming manifest. He reviews twenty-four examples that become his interpretative context for understanding that the statements in the Synoptic Gospels are implying the preexistence of the Son in the heavenly realm. He also argues that the sending sayings can be understood as having similar implications.

Gathercole offers a few related studies in the final chapters that only add to the value of this volume. First, he discusses the influence of Wisdom traditions on the Christology of the Synoptic Gospels and cautiously concludes that they are not nearly as influential as some have argued. Second, he offers a fascinating study of Matthew 23:37—"Jerusalem . . . how often have I desired to gather your children as a bird gathers her nestlings under her wings"—that moves from the observation that this is the first time Jesus is depicted in Jerusalem in Matthew to the implication that this saying reflects the preexistence of the Son who was active in the life of Israel in previous generations. Third, Gathercole spends a significant portion of the book (231–283) discussing four major titles of Jesus in the Synoptic Gospels: Christ, Lord, Son of Man, and Son of God. A chapter is devoted to each title, with attention given to how these particular titles may reflect the preexistence of the Son in some contexts. Although Gathercole shows scholarly caution at many points in

drawing his conclusions, his bold contribution signals that this subject should be receiving more attention in the future.

Charles A. Gieschen

An Introduction to the Study of Paul. By David G. Horrell. Second edition. London and New York: T&T Clark, 2006. 164 pages. Paperback. \$24.95.

David Horrell does not provide pat answers to questions about Paul but offers methodologies and tools by which students "can begin to evaluate the interpretations others propose and develop a perspective of their own" (xii). Horrell's target audience appears to be well-prepared undergraduate and graduate students who are already familiar with Paul's writings but now desire access to the mountain of material that has been written by modern scholars about Paul.

Horrell divides the book into nine chapters. Chapter 1 ("Introduction: Paul the man-mountain") provides a general introduction to Paul and his influence, together with what will be covered in the rest of the book. Chapter 2 ("From Jesus to Paul: pre-Pauline Christianity") probes Palestinian Christianity and the extent to which Paul and others may have used teachings descended from Jesus. Chapter 3 ("Paul's life: before and after his encounter with Christ") surveys Paul's life and missionary career. Chapter 4 ("Paul the letter-writer") surveys the non-disputed letters (1 Thessalonians, Galatians, 1-2 Corinthians, Philemon, Philippians, and Romans), compares these with ancient letters and papyri, and discusses whether or not rhetorical criticism should pertain to Paul's letters. Chapter 5 ("Paul the theologian: the central elements of Paul's gospel") grapples with central themes in Paul's theology and ethics, and pays attention to scholarly debates in each area. Chapter 6 ("Paul, Israel and the Jewish law") probes Paul's views on Israel, Judaism, and the Torah. In chapter 7 ("New approaches to the study of Paul: social-scientific, political and feminist interpretation"), Horrell discusses the many new approaches and methodologies that have been applied to Paul since the late-sixties. In chapter 8 ("Paul's legacy in the New Testament and beyond"), Horrell surveys the so-called Deutero-Paulines (Colossians, Ephesians, 2 Thessalonians, 1-2 Timothy, and Titus), then discusses Paul's influence upon both orthodox and heretical Christianity and upon such personages as Marcion, Augustine, Luther, Wesley, and Barth. Horrell concludes the book quite abruptly in chapter 9 ("Coming full circle: why study Paul today?"). There is a seven-page bibliography that contains a fair representation of important works in English, and two indices: one for biblical texts cited in the book and the other a combined subject/author index.

The book does an admirable job of introducing seminarians and pastors to the latest in Pauline research. Questions have moved on considerably since this reviewer was in seminary, though many of the old issues remain. Take

authorship, for example: it is a foregone conclusion among most scholars that Paul did not write the so-called "Deutero-Paulines" but that continuators expanded on Paul's authentic ideas by adapting them to later generations. Horrell more or less buys into this scheme (126-135), yet acknowledges that all thirteen letters could well have been written by Paul to address the practical needs of Christians who lived during Paul's lifetime (135).

More problematic to Lutherans is the question of what is central to Paul's theology: justification by grace through faith, or what E. P. Sanders has called "participation in Christ" (74). Horrell seems to side with Sanders in the debate, though he allows scholars of the "old perspective" to have their say (76-77). Discerning readers will note that Horrell is fair-minded throughout, although he shows a certain predilection toward what is new and non-traditional. Thus, he voices appreciation for feminist approaches (114-121) and doubts, for example, that Paul really wrote 1 Corinthians 14:34-35 (118). Paul could not have written the Pastoral Epistles either, claims Horrell, because those letters reveal a penchant for sound doctrine and church hierarchy more reflective of an increasingly rigid age (135-136). Paul was more an advocate of women's liberation than a chauvinist (114), though the issue must be more finely nuanced than this:

For some he is a voice for equality and liberation, for others a voice of male domination and women's oppression. Perhaps [Elizabeth Schüssler] Fiorenza is right to stress that any assessment of Paul in this regard must accept the ambivalent legacy which his letters represent; otherwise he may be somewhat one-sidedly claimed either as 'chauvinist', or as 'feminist' and 'liberationist'. (119)

In sum, this is a helpful book in that it offers an adequate introduction to the challenging field of Pauline studies for pastors and seminarians who already know a thing or two about Paul. Those who disagree with Horrell's positions will nonetheless appreciate his efforts toward providing varying sides to controversial issues and an evenhanded treatment throughout.

John G. Nordling

***Women Pastors? The Ordination of Women in Biblical Lutheran Perspective, A Collection of Essays.* Edited by Matthew C. Harrison and John T. Pless. St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 2008. 400 pages. Paperback. \$26.99.**

Brought together into a single volume are twenty-one previously published essays by eighteen Lutheran theologians opposed to the ordination of women. Essays have been organized into four subsections (exegetical, historical, systematic, pastoral), corresponding to the four sub-disciplines of a seminary curricula. It would be tedious to list the eighteen essayists here, but all have wrestled directly with the issue of women's ordination as this has infiltrated American Lutheran synods and European Lutheran state-related

churches. The book articulates why authentic Lutheranism cannot ordain women to the pastoral office and encourages struggling brothers and sisters in Christ who have suffered as a result of women's ordination (6-7). Courageous bishops—such as Walter Obare of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Kenya—have opposed women's ordination and have suffered ostracism by the Lutheran World Federation, drastic reductions in funding, charges of intransigence by the liberal establishment, and worse (CTQ 69 [2005]: 309-326). These essays show that since the apostolic age down through the past two millennia, including the Reformation era, the pastoral office was held by suitably trained male candidates of theology. Until recently this has been the consistent practice of the Lutheran church. *Women Pastors?* lets reader ponder what the Office of the Holy Ministry is and the reasons why Paul—and even our Lord Jesus Christ (Weinrich, 355-56)—allowed only for male pastors from the outset.

Two Pauline texts prohibit women from being placed into the office of the pastoral ministry: 1 Corinthians 14:33b-38 and 1 Timothy 2:11-14. Large segments of modern, western Christianity have variously sought to demonstrate that the prohibitions were not part of the original text (Schaibley's Argument A, 339), culturally conditioned (Argument B, 339-340), legalistic and so, not evangelical (Argument C, 340), or not supported by "at least one clear, distinct and unambiguous Bible passage" (Argument D, 341-342). With respect to Argument D, Scaer observes (242, 262; also Sasse, 269) that 1 Timothy 2:11-14 actually is a commentary on 1 Corinthians 14:33b-38, and both came from Paul. All the exegetical essays (Section 1, 11-105) affirm the traditional interpretation of these passages over against critical scholars and feminists who deconstruct them. No one has been able to demonstrate that the prohibitions were not written by Paul himself. A case can be made that the Pauline pronouncements were intended to protect the church against heretical and destructive tendencies already at work in apostolic times (e.g., 28, 32, 39, 47, 51, 92, 270-271, 288, 350-351, 354, etc.). To be sure, some textual variants place 1 Corinthians 14:34 and 35 after 14:40, but this tradition rests on shaky grounds. The evidence that 1 Corinthians 14:34 and 35 should be placed in its traditional location, and not after 14:40, is substantial. Marcion probably was the one responsible for removing it from its original location (Bryce, 64), a move that since then has provided fodder for interpolation theories that still make the rounds.

An overview of the three remaining subsections (historical, 109-166; systematic, 167-319; and pastoral, 321-395), would deprive readers of the benefit of coming to each essay on its own terms. Instead, what I shall offer is a summation of themes several essayists touch on in *Women Pastors?* For example, several admit that—biblically speaking (cf. Joel 2:28-29; Acts 2:17-18; 21:9)—women can prophesy (Kriewaldt, 46-47; Brunner, 197; Scaer, 241 n. 40; Sasse, 270; Weinrich, 359); nevertheless, prophecy differs from preaching in that prophecy was directly received through the Spirit (Kriewaldt, 46). One

either had the gift of prophecy or did not, somewhat like healing (Brunner, 196). It was always the case in the Christian assemblies, however, that prophecy was weighed, evaluated, and thus subjected to various norms (Kriewaldt, 47; also Giertz, 179; Brunner, 200; Weinrich, 129, 355). Women with charismatic gifts—like Miriam, Huldah, Deborah, the Virgin Mary, and Philip's daughters—did not yield to any internal impulses to preach (*vocatio interna*). "Keeping silence" must mean that they deliberately refrained from activity that could be construed as preaching: "they loved their Lord and knew that they had to obey his command" (Sasse, 272).

The prohibitions need not mean that women cannot speak at all during the worship service (Scaer, 234; Lockwood, 286), or that Priscilla (15, 127, 234, 238, 246, 264, 289) and other godly women (190, 194) did not instruct their own households in the faith. Nevertheless, Priscilla's teaching was done privately, i.e., outside the context of the service of Eucharist (Sasse, 271; Lockwood, 289), or even exceptionally (Weinrich, 354). In any event, there is no evidence that prophesying of the sort that Paul seems to countenance in 1 Corinthians 11:5 was the same thing as preaching or leading worship (Scaer, 242). Rather, Paul describes there the sort of witnessing in which all Christians engage.

Many of the essays comment favorably upon the so-called "order of creation" (38, 51, 152, 176, 198, 243, 272, 278, 294, 340, 348-349, 356, 363, 376), which might be defined in basic terms as "the right relationship between man and woman" (Gärtner, 38). This relationship had been violated at Corinth (Gärtner, 31-32; Brunner, 191, 201-202; Scaer, 228 n. 4; Sasse, 269). Today feminism diminishes some differences between men and women. Another view sees gender differences as a result of the fall into sin. But God created the two genders ("male and female he created them," Gen 1:27 RSV), and so distinctions between men and women are part of God's good creation (22, 53, 84, 161, 176, 191, 202, 211, 243, 246 n.46, 348, 366). So-called "headship" is based in part on 1 Corinthians 11:3 ("But I want you to understand that the head of every man [$\pi\alpha\nu\tau\omicron\varsigma\ \acute{\alpha}\nu\delta\rho\acute{\omicron}\varsigma$] is Christ, the head of a woman is her husband [$\gamma\upsilon\nu\alpha\iota\kappa\acute{\omicron}\varsigma\ \delta\ \acute{\alpha}\nu\eta\rho$], and the head of Christ is God," RSV). The imagery here cannot be dismissed (Scaer, 240); thus, the increasingly insistent demand for a pervasive unisexuality—which holds, for example, that distinctive differences between man and woman are interchangeable—is contrary to creation and should not be tolerated in the church. Gender matters for Christians, who, in their inter-human relationships (husband-wife), reflect the unseen relationships that are operative between the diverse persons of the Trinity (Gieschen, 85; Brunner, 203; Kleinig, 217-225; Scaer, 240). Weinrich's thinking is most remarkable in this respect: humanity is "essentially binary" (363), "exists in twos" (368 n. 22), and is therefore apprehensible "in two consubstantial forms" (370). Feminism disrupts this by insisting that all human persons must be interchangeable; but God intended that there should be a wholesome complementariness as each diverse Christian submits to the demands of vocation, which, in turn, cannot be divorced from gender (376).

The point is that man and woman are *different* from one another, and so should have *different roles* at home and in the church (Giertz, 176, 180; Kleinig, 222; Scaer, 240; Lockwood, 291 n. 27). Only at the resurrection on the Last Day will the differences between man and woman be done away with (Gärtner, 33; Kriewaldt, 53; Scaer, 238 n. 33, 245 n. 43). Therefore, the rush to ordain theologically articulate women results, sadly, in a diminution of the service that women do within the church (Giertz, 180; Brunner, 213; Slenczka, 317–318; Smith, 395) and has had a profoundly negative impact also upon hearth and home: “the ordination of women contradicts the spiritual vocation of men as husbands and fathers and empties marriage and family life of much of their spiritual significance” (Kleinig, 222). Moreover, the ordination of women has in some churches in some Lutheran and Anglican communions prepared the way for the ordination of homosexuals. Of course, as many proponents of women’s ordination insist, the ordination of women and the ordination of homosexuals are separate issues. The pattern of argumentation, however, for both ordinations follows identical trajectories: first, the appeal to Galatians 3:28 (a text that was engaged throughout this volume); and, second, the idea that the biblical writers were conditioned by their time and culture, so that “what a text meant” then is not necessarily the same as “what it means” for us today (Lockwood, 291 n. 28).

I need to point out two observations: first, the essayists in *Women Pastors?* are all male, which could lead some to suppose that *only men* think women should not be ordained—a completely wrong idea, of course. Some theologically articulate women should have been invited to contribute. Second, several of the essayists—Giertz (176, 177); Kleinig (223); Lockwood (292 n. 31); and Slenczka (313)—argue that Ephesians 5:21 (“Submit to one another out of reverence for Christ [ὑποτασσόμενοι ἀλλήλοις ἐν φόβῳ Χριστοῦ],” NIV) advocates the submission of husbands and wives *to one another*. This type of interpretation is often used to placate feminists and others who cannot abide by the idea that one group of Christians (wives, in this instance) should have to submit to another group of Christians (husbands), but this is what Ephesians 5:21 means in its context (cf. Eph 5:22–6:9). Only one essay gets this right (Kriewaldt, 48), but does not go far enough, in my opinion. Again, Weinrich’s second essay comes closest to expressing correctly the relationship that God intends should exist between man and woman (377–378).

Women Pastors? offers a lot about men, women, the way men and women were created by God to relate to each other, inter-Trinitarian relationships, and the Office of the Holy Ministry. Smith’s essay at the end (389–395) gives hope that those who ordain women now may be persuaded not to do so in the future. This book is must reading for all—clergy and lay alike—in an egalitarian society.

The Division of Christendom: Christianity in the Sixteenth Century. By Hans J. Hillerbrand. Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2007. 504 pages. Paperback. \$49.95.

The Reformation—like all era-making episodes in history—was a complex amalgam of theological controversies, attendant political circumstances, and socio-cultural change. Historians of sixteenth-century Europe have long debated the priority each of these phenomena should be given in recounting the story and assessing the significance of the Reformation. Over the last three or four decades the trend has been towards social history, but, despite its many valuable contributions to scholarship, social historiography has in many respects lost sight of the significant theological refinements and developments that occurred during the period.

Histories of Europe in the sixteenth century that keep a keen eye on the theology of the era are, however, still being written. *The Division of Christendom* by Hans J. Hillerbrand serves as, perhaps, the most recent and finest example. Beginning with a survey of developments in late medieval European society, the book focuses in on where it all started: the indulgence controversy of 1517. From here Hillerbrand weaves a captivating narrative covering every region in Europe—from the British Isles to Hungary to Scandinavia—touched and shaped by reform movements.

Hillerbrand is primarily concerned with explaining the cause of the division of *corpus Christianum* during the sixteenth century. Thus, considerable attention is given to Luther and the Lutherans up to 1580 with the compilation of the Book of Concord. Detailed chapter-length attention is also given to the rise and diversification of Anabaptism (and more radical forms of dissent), the emergence and proliferation of Calvinism, the peculiar history of reformation in England, and, of course, the Church of Rome's response to all this. While the narrative focuses especially on the "interplay of religious and political forces," ample consideration is also given to the social history of the Reformation.

Certainly numerous histories of the Reformation cover the same material. One would, nevertheless, be hard pressed to find a narrative as wide in scope yet as economical and precise in detail as *The Division of Christendom*. Reformation enthusiasts in particular, but also anyone generally interested in the intellectual and cultural history of Western civilization—regardless of how erudite—will find this an extremely useful and learned book.

Adam S. Francisco