

THEOLOGICAL QUARTERLY.

VOL. XIII.

APRIL, 1909.

No. 2.

THE INFALLIBLE POPE.

"The historian is seen at his best when he does not appear."

The Romanist Klee in his *Dogmatics*, vol. 1, p. 210, called it a Protestant slander that Catholics thought the Pope infallible. (Hase I, p. 277.) The Scotch Catholic Father Keenan in his *Controversial Catechism* says of the Pope's infallibility: "This is a Protestant invention; it is no article of the Catholic faith." Since 1870 this damaging statement has been quietly dropped, and no hint given that the text differs from the author's own editions of 1846 and 1853. (Sidney, p. 86.)

In the "Form of Oath and Declaration," taken in 1793 by all Irish Catholics, occur the words: "I also declare that it is not an article of the Catholic faith, neither am I thereby required to believe or profess that the Pope is infallible." And a Synod of Irish Bishops in 1810 declared this oath and declaration to be "a constituent part of the Roman Catholic religion." (Quirinus, p. 189.) Archbishop Murray, Bishop Doyle, and others in 1824 and 1825 before both houses of Parliament swore, "that it is not an article of the Catholic faith, neither are Catholics bound to believe, that popes are infallible." (B. W.-A., p. 270.)

On July 18, 1870, Pope Pius IX decreed: "We teach and define that it is a dogma divinely revealed; that the Roman Pontiff, when he speaks 'ex cathedra,' that is, when in discharge of the office of Pastor and Doctor of all Christians, by virtue of his supreme Apostolic authority, he defines a doc-

LUTHER AND LIBERTY.

A SYMPOSIUM OF EXPRESSIONS ON THIS SUBJECT TAKEN FROM
NON-LUTHERAN AUTHORS.

The Lutheran Church regards Luther as the divinely-sent liberator of the Church. Luther proclaimed the long-lost doctrine of justification by faith alone, the doctrine, that we are made free from sin, righteous, and heirs of salvation, not by the works of the Law, but by grace, for Christ's sake, through faith. This doctrine, restored to the Church by Luther, is the source of Christian liberty, of freedom from all human authority in matters of faith. Luther declared that Christ is the only Head of the Church, that He rules and governs His Church by His Spirit and Word, and that He has empowered no human being to impose laws on the Christian's conscience in spiritual matters. He also stood for total separation of Church and State, for a free and independent Church and a free and independent State, for freedom of conscience and worship, and *against* all external force and violence in matters religious.

Under the providence of God the work of Luther in behalf of Christian and religious liberty has also become the source

of secular and political freedom. The emancipation of civil governments from the blighting power of Rome, freedom of thought, and freedom of the press, are a remote but ripe fruit of Luther's Reformation. We may safely assert that there would be no *free* America with its *free* institutions, if Luther had not lived. "Luther and Liberty" is, therefore, an historically correct collocation of terms. "It is not, therefore, inexact to say that Luther was, in point of fact, the restorer of liberty to the ages which followed his era," says Michelet, the Roman Catholic but honest and conscientious historian. His is by no means an isolated expression of this kind. Such statements, made in just recognition of historical truth, are numerous. We have gathered a large number of similar expressions. They are all taken from non-Lutheran authors, Catholic as well as Protestant, and can therefore not be suspected of having been inspired by partiality. Having made use of some of them at different times and places where they were invariably heard with great interest and pleasure, and having been repeatedly requested to publish them, we now present these opinions to the readers of the *QUARTERLY*, in the hope that they will welcome them and find them to be useful.

James Bryce, the versatile political and historical writer and British Ambassador to the United States, says: "The monk of Wittenberg proclaimed [at Worms] to an astonished church and Emperor that the day of spiritual tyranny was past. . . . It [the Reformation] was in its essence the assertion of the principle of *individuality*—that is to say, of true spiritual freedom. . . . It became a revolt against despotism of every kind; it erected the standard of civil as well as of religious liberty." (*The Holy Roman Empire*. MacMillan and Co., New York, 1880, ch. XVIII, pp. 321. 328. 331.)

Prof. Williston Walker, D. D., of Hartford Theological Seminary writes: "He [Luther] was the pioneer of the road to spiritual freedom." (*The Reformation*. Charles Scribner's Sons, 1900, p. 77.)

The Very Rev. Principal *John Tulloch*, Scottish theolo-

gian and author: "What is known as Protestantism, or the theory of religious liberty, owes its birth to him [Luther]. . . . The courage of a single man as he faced on that great occasion [at Worms] 'the mailed chivalry of Germany' gave the courage which inspired the famous Protest [at Speyer, 1529], and laid the foundation of all Christian and ecclesiastical liberties." (*Luther and Recent Criticism. Nineteenth Century*, April, 1884, pp. 657. 660.)

Again: "This faith in a divine righteousness near to every soul made for itself a joyful way among the nations, and carried with it, wherever it went, liberty and strength. . . . It is impossible to conceive a more unqualified assertion of the right of private judgment—of the indefeasible privilege of the individual reason to know and judge the truth for itself" [than Luther's "magnanimous and always memorable words: 'Unless I be convinced by Scripture or by reason, I can and will retract nothing; for to act against my conscience is neither safe nor honest. Here I stand'"]. (*Luther and other Leaders of the Reformation*, by John Tulloch, D. D., Principal of St. Mary's College in the University of St. Andrews; one of Her Majesty's Chaplains for Scotland; 3d ed., William Blackwood & Sons, 1883, pp. 167. 171.)

The Athenaeum calls Luther "The extraordinary man to whom we are mainly indebted for the most valuable of all blessings—freedom of opinion." (No. 452, June 25, 1836, p. 444.)

Merle d'Aubigne (Reformed): "Luther was far before his age, and even before several other [?] reformers, on the subject of religious liberty." (*History of the Reformation*, p. 272.)

Bancroft, the most famous American historian: "Luther alone has the glory of forbidding to fight for the gospel with violence and death." (*History of the United States*.)

Eugene Lawrence, American author, born October 10, 1823: "It was the decisive moment of modern history. The mightiest intellect of the age was roused into sudden action;

the intellect whose giant strength was to shiver to atoms the magnificent fabric of papal superstition, and give freedom of thought and liberty to man. Luther rose up inspired." (*Harper's*, June, 1869, vol. 39, p. 101.)

Rev. Kerr Boyce Tupper, D. D., LL. D., Baptist: "Truer words were never spoken than those of Martin Luther: 'Over the soul God can and will allow no one to rule but Himself.'" (Address given at Denver, Colo., 1893, on *America's Privileges and Perils*. *Homiletic Review*, vol. 27, p. 51.)

Rev. Edward J. Young, A. M., Cambridge, Mass.: "The humble miner's son, who was born on St. Martin's eve, and who became the leader of one of the most important movements of human history, will be forever remembered as having contributed more than any other individual to the civil and religious liberty of modern times." (Before the Massachusetts Historical Society, Nov. 8, 1883. *Proceedings of the Mass. Hist. Soc.*, vol. XX, p. 358.)

James Freeman Clarke, Unitarian clergyman and author, 1810—1888: "So stands Luther, growing more and more the mark of reverence through succeeding centuries,—the real author of modern liberty of thought and action." (p. 256.) "In spite of all sophistry and subtlety Luther will be regarded through all time as the champion of human liberty, and Loyola as that of human slavery." (p. 273 f.) (*Events and Epochs in Religious History*, 1880, pp. 256. 273 f.)

George William Curtis, American author and popular lecturer, 1824—1892: "In the truest sense Luther is the father of modern civilization. He emancipated the human mind from ecclesiastical slavery. He proclaimed that freedom of thought without which it is easy to see that, despite the great modern inventions, the spirit of the Dark Ages must have been indefinitely prolonged, and the course of modern civilization must have been essentially different. It was the spiritual freedom which Luther asserted that produced political freedom and the freedom of the press; Luther's spirit was to make the invention of Gutenberg the true servant of humanity, and to open to the

benign genius of liberty the lands to which Gioja's mariner's compass should point the way." (*Harper's*, Nov., 1883, vol. 67, p. 958.)

Rev. William M. Taylor, D. D., LL. D., (Presbyterian) pastor of Broadway Tabernacle, New York: "Luther stood for freedom of conscience, and thereby also widened the area of liberty in general. He asserted the equality of all men before God, in Christ, and out of that came at length, here and elsewhere, the Declaration of Independence, which affirms the equality of all men before human law. Had he flinched and recanted like Galileo, there would have been no such result. It is to the confessor of faith, and not of science, that we are indebted for the liberty we now enjoy." (At Luther Celebration, Academy of Music, N. Y., Nov. 13, 1883.)

Francois Auguste Marie Mignet, French historian, 1796 to 1884: "These three grand pioneers of modern progress gave to the human race—Columbus a new continent, Copernicus the law of the spheres, Luther the right of free thought. This last and most perilous achievement was the prize of an indomitable will. Summoned for four years to submit, Luther for four years said, No! He said to the legate, No! He said to the Pope, No! He said [at Worms] to the Emperor, No! That heroic and pregnant 'No!' bore within it the liberties of the world." (Translated by Hon. William M. Robbins.)

Jules Michelet, the brilliant French Catholic historian and essayist, 1798—1874, says in his *Life of Luther*, 1835: "Whatever sympathy, however, may be felt with this amiable and winning individuality of Luther, it must not be suffered to influence our judgment with reference to the doctrines which he, on all occasions, inculcates, or blind us to the consequences which are its necessary result. . . . It is not, therefore, inexact to say that Luther was, in point of fact, the restorer of liberty to the ages which followed his era. He denied it theoretically, indeed" ["He sacrificed free-will to grace, man to God, morality to a sort of providential fatality"!], "but he established it in practice; if he did not absolutely create, he at least courage-

ously signed his name to the great revolution which legalized in Europe the right of free examination. To him it is, in great measure, owing that we of the present day exercise in its plenitude that first great right of the human understanding, to which all the rest are annexed, without which all the rest are naught. We cannot think, speak, write, read, for a single moment, without gratefully recalling to mind this enormous benefit of intellectual enfranchisement. The very lines I here trace, to whom do I owe it that I am able to send them forth, if not to the liberator of modern thought? This tribute paid to Luther, we the less hesitate to admit, that our own sympathies are not with him in the religious revolution he operated." (*Life of Luther*, 1835, transl. by William Hazlitt. Bohn's *Standard Library*, London, 1904, preface, pp. XI. XII.)

John H. Treadwell: "That the principles of Martin Luther are the fundamental principles of our American Republic there can be no question. Surely, then, it is incumbent on us who have lighted the beacon of invitation to bid others come and enjoy with us liberty of person and conscience, to know him better." (*Martin Luther*, Putnams, 1889, preface, p. III.)

Benson J. Lossing, LL. D., the distinguished historical writer, 1813—1891: "In the heat of that conflict, which has continued ever since, have been evolved the representative government, the free institutions, and the liberty, equality, and fraternity which are the birthrights of every American citizen of whatever hue or creed." (*Our Country*. New York, Johnson & Miles, 1877, vol. I, ch. X, p. 117.)

The Hon. Robert C. Winthrop, American statesman and noted classic orator, particularly on historical themes, 1809 to 1894: "We are here to-day [Saturday, November 10, 1883] to recognize Martin Luther as, beyond all other men, the instrument of God in giving the impulse, by thought, word, and act, to that world-wide movement which resulted not merely in the reformation of Europe, but in all that we Americans now enjoy, and all that we rejoice in being. Pilgrim and Puritan,

Cavalier and Roundhead, Huguenot and Quaker, yes, and Roman Catholic also, consciously or unconsciously, all alike felt that impulse, and American colonization and the American Revolution were among its results. . . . No sectarian, or even merely Protestant, views enter into this commemoration. But we come as students of history, and in just recognition of historical truth, to hail the advent, and do grateful homage to the memory, and listen to the inspiring story, of a mighty instrument of God in awakening and rousing and reforming the world for all time and for all places beneath the sun; a man of indomitable courage and of unwavering faith in Christ, who kindled a flame of spiritual liberty never to be extinguished, but which is to burn brighter and brighter until the perfect day." (Introductory address delivered before the Massachusetts Historical Society at the Luther Celebration, Nov. 10, 1883. *Proceedings*, vol. XX, pp. 363. 364.)

The Rev. Dr. Frederic Henry Hedge of Harvard University, 1805—1891: "But this we may safely assert: that the dearest goods of our estate—civil independence, spiritual emancipation, individual scope, the large room, the unbound thought, the free pen, whatever is most characteristic of this New England of our inheritance—we owe to the Saxon reformer in whose name we are here to-day. . . . To Martin Luther, above all men, we Anglo-Americans are indebted for national independence and mental freedom. . . . It is from this point of view, and not as a teacher of religious truth, that he claims our interest. The Protestant Reformation, I have said, is not to be regarded as a mere theological or ecclesiastical movement, however Luther may have meant it as such. In a larger view, it was secular emancipation, deliverance of the nations that embraced it, from an irresponsible theocracy, whose main interest was the consolidation and perpetuation of its own dominion. . . . Honor and everlasting thanks to the man who broke for us the spell of papal autocracy; who rescued a portion, at least, of the Christian world from the paralyzing grasp of a power more to be dreaded than any temporal despotism,

—a power which rules by seducing the will, by capturing the conscience of its subjects,—the bondage of the soul! Luther alone, by faith and courage, by all his endowments,—ay, and by all his limitations,—was fitted to accomplish that saving work, a work whose full import he could not know, whose far-reaching consequences he had not divined. They shape our life. Modern civilization, liberty, science, social progress, attest the world-wide scope of the Protestant Reformer, whose principles are independent thought, freedom from ecclesiastical thrall, defiance of consecrated wrong. . . . Our age still obeys the law of that movement whose van he led, and the latest age will bear its impress. . . . Honor to the man whose timely revolt checked the progress of triumphant wrong: who wrested the heritage of God from sacerdotal hands, defying the traditions of immemorial time!" (Oration on Luther before the Massachusetts Historical Society, Nov. 10, 1883. *Proceedings*, vol. XX, pp. 365. 366. 382 f.)

The Hon. John Jay, American diplomatist, 1817—1894, United States minister to Austria 1869—1875: "It seemed fitting that this Alliance, on which has devolved in part the work of maintaining the great truths proclaimed by Luther, against the selfsame forces with which he contended, and against all other forces, foreign or domestic, which threaten our religious liberties and the purity of American institutions, should call on Americans to join with the rest of Christendom in commemorating the birth of the great Reformer. No country has more reason than this Republic to recall with joy the blessings he assisted to secure for the world, in emancipating thought and conscience, and in impressing the stamp of Christianity upon modern civilization. Although America had not been discovered by Columbus when Luther was born, Luther's far-reaching influence, which to-day is felt from the Atlantic to the Pacific, helped to people our Northern Continent with the colonists, who laid the foundation of its future liberties on the truths of the Bible." (At the Luther Celebration, Academy of Music, New York, Nov. 10, 1883.)

Arthur W. Kennedy: "He [Luther] saw the priceless heritage of personal religious liberty, and the idea set him in motion to blaze his way among mankind with this axe of truth." (p. 429.) "In this country the liberty which every man enjoys, to worship God according to the dictates of his own conscience so long as he preserves good order and the public peace, is a fruit of the Reformation." (p. 431.) "Luther's first aim was not a change in the political condition of the people; his teachings were all directed at abuses in the church and changes in theology, but as the church and state were so wedded and interlocked, how could it be otherwise that when Luther struck the blow that gave men religious liberty it gave them political liberty also? . . . If a man had liberty to think for himself in religion, he was now just as free to think for himself as a citizen in the state. Luther may not have anticipated such a result as this politically, for he was not a politician. He did not presume to serve as a statesman, and yet he did in the state what he, apparently, had no thought of doing, namely: he commenced a political reformation that has through the centuries run almost parallel with the religious reformation, and the political fruits are not the least among the great blessings that Luther's Reformation has conferred upon the world." (p. 533.) "On this foundation of principles [in the Declaration of Independence] our fathers built a superstructure and named it the United States of America, giving to liberty a new world, kindling a fire where it could not be extinguished—forming a new government on virgin soil, with political liberty as one of its cardinal doctrines. It was a ripe fruit of the Reformation. . . . For more than a hundred years this fruit of Luther's Reformation has been one of the choicest blessings that has come to America. . . . We see religious and political liberty, presented to the world by Luther." (p. 535. *Some Fruits of the Reformation. Chautauquan*, July, August, September, 1899.)

Daniel Webster, the great American orator and statesman, says in his Address at the Completion of Bunker Hill Monu-

ment, June 17, 1843: "The Reformation of Luther broke out, kindling up the minds of men afresh, leading to new habits of thought, and awakening in individuals energies before unknown even to themselves. The religious controversies of this period changed society, as well as religion. They changed man himself, in his modes of thought, his consciousness of his own powers, and his desire of intellectual attainment. The spirit of commercial and foreign adventure, therefore, on the one hand and, on the other, the assertion and maintenance of religious liberty, having their source indeed in the Reformation, . . . and this love of religious liberty drawing after it or bringing along with it, as it always does, an ardent devotion to the principle of civil liberty also, were the powerful influences under which character was formed and men trained for the great work of introducing English civilization, English law, and what is more than all, Anglo-Saxon blood, into the wilderness of North America." (Works, 7th ed., 1853, vol. I, p. 94.)

Bancroft: "But it was not then possible in Europe to reconstruct the church on the principle of its total separation from tradition and the state. Did Luther look to the newly discovered world as the resting-place of his teachings? He certainly devised and proposed the rules for emigration. When the great revelation of truth was made, 'a star,' said he, 'moved in the sky, and guided the pilgrim wise men to the manger where the Savior lay.¹⁾ He advised the oppressed country people, taking with them the preacher of their choice and the open Bible, to follow 'the star' of freedom to lands where religious liberty could find a home." (*History of the United States of America*. Boston, Little, Brown, & Co., 1875, vol. X, p. 78.)

Again: "The earth, wrapt in thickest darkness, sighed for the dawn. The son of a miner, of the peasant class in Eisleben, trained in the school of Paul of Tarsus and the African Augustine, kindled a light for the world. He taught that no man impersonates the authority of God. . . . 'There is but one master, and his name is Christ in heaven;' and, collecting all

1) Ermahnung zum Frieden auf die zwölf Artikel der Bauerschaft.

in one great formulary of freedom, he declared: Justification by faith; by faith alone, 'sola fide.' . . . The principle of justification by faith alone solved every problem. It is freedom against authority; self-activity against superstitious trust in other men. It was the knell of the departing dominion of an alien prince over the conscience of the peoples. . . . Well, therefore, did Leibnitz say of Luther: "This is he who, in later times, taught the human race hope and free thought." . . . Further; he demanded that truth should be spread by appeals to reason alone. 'If fire,' said he, 'is the right cure for heresy, then the fagot-burners are the most learned doctors on earth. Nor need we study any more: he that has brute force on his side may burn his adversary at the stake.' 'I will preach the truth, speak the truth, write the truth, but will force the truth on no one; for faith must be accepted willingly, and without compulsion.' . . . On the right of private judgment, Luther said: 'If the emperor or the princes should command me and say: "Thus and thus you ought to believe," then I speak: "Dear emperor, dear princes, your demand is too high;" they say: "Yes, you must be obedient to us, for we are the higher powers." Then I answer: "Yes, you are lords over this temporal life, but not over the eternal life;" they speak further: "Yes, peace and unity must be preserved; therefore you must believe as the emperor and princes believe." . . . No, dear emperor, dear prince, dear lord, dear lady, it does not belong to you to make such a demand.' And again: 'All bishops that take the right of judgment of doctrine from the sheep are certainly to be held as murderers and thieves, wolves and apostate Christians. Christ gives the right of judgment to the scholars and sheep. St. Paul will have no doctrine or proposition held, till it has been proved and recognized as good by the congregation that hears it. Every Christian has God's Word, and is taught of God and anointed as a priest.' It followed, as the rule for all Christendom, that the teacher, 'the minister of the Word,' should be elected by the congregation itself." (L. c., pp. 74—77.)

Hon. William H. H. Miller, Attorney-General in President Harrison's cabinet from 1889 to 1893, said: "We cannot claim for our Anglo-Saxon ancestors any special preeminence as champions in the great tournament of freedom. Romance with all the grand figures of its Lancelots, its Arthurs and its Ivan-hoes, furnishes no picture of such heroic courage, moral and physical, as Martin Luther nailing his theses, his declaration of the right of private judgment, to the door of the Church in Wittenberg, or standing in the hostile presence of the Emperor of Germany and his magnificent array of Kings, Princes, and Barons, in the Diet of Worms, and to the demand that he recant announcing: 'I cannot and I will not recant a single word.' If it be said that the contest of Luther was for religious rather than civil liberty, the ready answer is that civil and religious liberty are inseparable; that one cannot live when the other dies." (Address given in Connecticut, July 4, 1892. *Luth. Quart.*, Oct., 1892, vol. XXII, p. 549.)

James Anthony Froude, the greatest English historian of recent times, wrote in 1884: "The Bible to him [Luther] was the sole infallible authority, where every Christian for himself could find the truth and the road to salvation, if he faithfully and piously looked for it. . . . Luther hated lies. But he was against violence, even to destroy falsehood." (*Luther*. Charles Scribner's Sons, 1884, pp. 42. 76.)

Edwin D. Meade, the eminent Unitarian of Boston, says in his *Martin Luther*: "Luther has done more than any other man ever did to emancipate the human mind from usurped authority. . . . When the flood of his inspiration is upon him, Luther declares the right of private judgment and freedom from all external authority with the same emphasis and fullness with which the prophet of to-day would speak. . . . Luther's mighty hammer fell upon the bell that knelled at once the death of priest and pope, and rang in, to an enslaved and thirsty nation, the gospel of original relations with God once more. . . . If he had one conviction firmer than others, it was that the sword should never be used in propagation of the truth. 'It is

through the Word, and not by force,' he loved to say, 'that wisdom governs.' 'I will preach, I will talk, I will write,' he said, 'but I will not use force or compulsion with any one.'"
(*Martin Luther, a Study of the Reformation.* Boston, Geo. H. Ellis, 1884, pp. 61. 137. 153.)

William Cullen Bryant:

At last the earthquake came — the shock that hurled
To dust, in many fragments dashed and strown,
The throne, whose roots were in another world,
And whose far-stretching shadow awed our own.
From many a proud monastic pile, o'erthrown,
Fear-struck, the hooded inmates rushed and fled;
The web, that for a thousand years had grown
O'er prostrate Europe, in that day of dread
Crumbled and fell, as fire dissolves the flaxen thread.

(*The Ages*, stanza XXIII.)